

PROCEEDINGS
of the
Society of Antiquaries
of Scotland



Volume 132
(2002)

Royal Museum of Scotland
Chambers Street · Edinburgh

This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Requests for permission to reproduce material from the *Proceedings* should be sent to the Director, as well as the author, illustrator, photographer or other copyright holder.

Copyright in the *Proceedings* rests with the Society and the individual authors. It is permitted, without the need for specific authorization or payment of a fee, to photocopy

- i. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for the private use of an individual;
- ii. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use;
- iii. multiple copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for a non-profit-making institution for educational use within that institution only.

The consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, the creation of new collective works or resale.

Where indicated, maps have been based on Ordnance Survey maps by permission, © Crown Copyright

ISSN 0081–1564

Produced by Maney Publishing, Hudson Road, Leeds LS9 7DL, UK.

Table of Contents

v	EDITORIAL BOARD
vi	COUNCIL
vii	PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS
ix	LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND
xi	EDITORIAL
	ARTICLES AND REPORTS
1	Presenting the Scottish Past: the Rhind Lectures for the Session 1999–2000, part 2
1	‘The foremost figure in all matters relating to Scottish archaeology’: aspects of the work of Joseph Anderson (1832–1916) David V Clarke
19	James Curle (1862–1944) and Alexander Ormiston Curle (1866–1955): pillars of the establishment J N Graham Ritchie
43	Ludovic McLellan Mann (1869–1955): ‘the eminent archaeologist’ J N Graham Ritchie
65	Claish, Stirling: an early Neolithic structure in its context Gordon J Barclay, Kenneth Brophy & Gavin MacGregor
139	Excavation at a Mesolithic and Neolithic occupation site at Chapelfield, Cowie, Stirling John Atkinson
193	An Early Bronze Age short-cist burial at Abbey Mains Farm, Haddington, East Lothian John A Lawson, David Henderson & Alison Sheridan
205	An Iron Age child burial at Dunbar Golf Course, East Lothian Louise Baker
213	Late prehistoric settlement, Berryhill, Aberdeenshire Hilary Murray
229	Excavation of a burnt mound and associated structures at Ceann nan Clachan, North Uist Ian Armit & Alan Braby
259	Some excavations on the line of the Antonine Wall, 1994–2001 Andrew Dunwell, Geoff Bailey, Alan Leslie & Andrea Smith

305	Philology on Tacitus' Graupian Hill and Trucculan Harbour Andrew Breeze
313	A first millennium AD cemetery, rectangular Bronze Age structure and late prehistoric settlement at Thornybank, Midlothian Alastair R Rees
357	Rheged: an Early Historic Kingdom near the Solway Mike McCarthy
383	The medieval development of South Leith and the creation of Rotten Row Simon Stronach
425	Excavation of two ditches and a medieval grain-drying kiln, Inverness, Highland Clare Ellis
439	The late 13th-century chapter seals of Dunkeld and Oslo Cathedrals Virginia Glenn
459	The Pottery at Thorsk, Stirlingshire c 1600–c 1800: context, links and survival John G Harrison
475	Highland rural settlement studies: a critical history Chris Dalglish
499	Sir William Bruce: 'the chief introducer of Architecture in this country' Aonghus MacKechnie
521	A group of <i>cache</i> balls from St Andrews Ian Carradice
529	The linen weavers of Drumsheugh and the linen damask tablecloth woven to commemorate the visit of George IV to Scotland in 1822 Vanessa Habib & Helen Clark
555	LECTURE SUMMARIES
561	MEETINGS OF THE SOCIETY 2001–2002
579	INDEX

Editorial Board for the *Proceedings* 2001–2002

Editor

GORDON J BARCLAY, MA, PhD, FSA, FSA Scot, MIFA

Editorial Board

FIONNA ASHMORE, BA, FSA, FSA Scot (*Director*)

DAVID P BOWLER, BA, MPhil, FSA Scot

IAIN GORDON BROWN, MA, PhD, FRSA, FSA, FSA Scot

IAN CAMPBELL, BA, MA, DPhil, FSA Scot

GEORGE DALGLEISH, MA, FSA Scot

CHRISTOPHER LOWE, BA, MA, PhD, FSA Scot, MIFA

ANN MACSWEEN, MA, MA, PhD, FSA Scot, MIFA

MAGDALENA MIDGLEY, MA, PhD, FSA Scot

ATHOL MURRAY, MA, PhD, FSA Scot

RICHARD ORAM, MA, PhD, FSA Scot

ANNA RITCHIE, OBE, BA, PhD, FSA, FSA Scot

J N GRAHAM RITCHIE, MA, PhD, MBA, FSA, PSA Scot (*President*)

ALAN SAVILLE, BA, FSA, FSA Scot, MIFA (*Convener*)

SUSAN E SERIGHT, DipMGS, AMA, FSA Scot

JILL TURNBULL, CQSW, BA, PhD

Indexer

ELIZABETH FOWLER, MA, BLitt, FSA Scot

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council for 2001–2002

President

J N GRAHAM RITCHIE, MA, PhD, MBA, FSA

Vice Presidents

W DAVID H SELLAR, BA, LLB, FRHistS

COLLEEN BATEY, BA, PhD, MIFA

DOREEN GROVE, BA, FSA

Treasurer

NAOMI TARRANT, BA, AMA, FSA

Councillors

CHRISTOPHER LOWE, BA, MA, PhD, MIFA

MARY A MACLEOD, BA, MA, PhD, MIFA

MAGDALENA S MIDGLEY, MA, PhD

ANDREA N SMITH, BA, MIFA

JANE GEDDES, BA, MA, PhD

CHARLOTTE M LYTHE, MA

RICHARD ORAM, MA, PhD

SUSAN E SERIGHT, DipMGS, AMA

DAVID P BOWLER, BA, MPhil

EWAN CAMPBELL, BSc, PhD, MIFA

JILL TURNBULL, CQSW, BA, PhD

ROBIN TURNER, BA, MIFA

Ex-Officio

Chairman of the North East Section

Finance & Administration Convener

Heritage Committee Convener

Publications Committee Convener

Research Committee Convener

Representative to the Ancient Monuments

Board for Scotland

Representative of the National Museums of
Scotland

AIDAN MULKERRIN, BA, MLitt

HUMPHREY HOLMES, CA

FIONNA M ASHMORE, BA, FSA

ALAN SAVILLE, BA, FSA, MIFA

IAN A G SHEPHERD, MA, FSA, MIFA

JILL HARDEN, BSc, AMA, MIFA

DAVID V CLARKE, BA, PhD, FSA

Director

FIONNA ASHMORE, BA, FSA

Proceedings Editor

GORDON J BARCLAY, MA, PhD, FSA, MIFA

Monograph Series Editor

ALEXANDRA SHEPHERD, MA, MIFA

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, 1 December 2000 to 30 November 2001

Patron

HM The Queen

Honorary Fellows

HRH THE DUKE OF ROTHESAY

EMERITUS PROFESSOR LESLIE ALCOCK, OBE, MA, FSA, FRHist S

PROFESSOR BERTIL ALMGREN

DR ROBERT GEOFFREY WILLIAM ANDERSON, BSc, MA, DPhil, FRSCHEM, FSA, FRSE

AUBREY BURL, MA, DLitt, PhD, FSA, FSA Scot

ARKITEKT HAKON CHRISTIE

PROFESSOR JOHN COLES, MA, PhD, ScD, FBA, FSA, FSA Scot

SIR HOWARD COLVIN, CVO, CBE, FBA, FSA, FRHistS, HonFRIBA

PROFESSOR EMERITA ROSEMARY CRAMP, CBE, MA, FSA, FSA Scot

JOHN GREENWELL DUNBAR, OBE, MA, HonFRIAS, FSA, FSA Scot

EMERITUS PROFESSOR ALEXANDER FENTON, CBE, BA, MA, DLitt, HonDLitt, HRSA, FRSE, FSA

PROFESSOR PIERRE ROLAND GIOT

MISS AUDREY SHORE HENSHALL, OBE, MA, FSA

ARNE HOFF, PhD

PROFESSOR DR LEENDERT P LOUWE KOOLJMAN

DR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN

DR ANTOINE PLĂMĂDEALĂ

PROFESSOR KLAUS RANDBORG

PROFESSOR COLIN RENFREW (LORD RENFREW OF KAIMSTHORN), ScD, FBA, FSA, FSA Scot

PROFESSOR HANS SCHÖNBERGER

DR WILLIAM TAYLOR

PROFESSOR CHARLES THOMAS, CBE, DL, DLitt, HonDlitt, FBA, HonMRIA, FSA

PROFESSOR BRUCE TRIGGER, PhD, DSc, DLitt, FRSCan

PROFESSOR J D VAN DER WAALS

PROFESSOR DR WILLIE GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE

LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND, INSTITUTED
NOVEMBER 1780 AND INCORPORATED BY ROYAL CHARTER, 6 MAY 1783

- 1 The purpose of the Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
- 2 The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
- 3 Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by a Fellow. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not resident in the United Kingdom, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances to waive the necessity for a sponsor.
- 4 Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. Fellows may vote against any candidate by striking out the name from the list and returning the list to the Society before the meeting or placing the list in the Ballot Box before the meeting commences. Candidates receiving ten or more adverse votes will be balloted for individually at the meeting, and any candidate then receiving less than two-thirds of the votes shall not be admitted.
- 5 Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed twenty-five.
- 6 Corresponding Members must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows. They shall not be liable for a fee for admission or annual subscription. This Law is now repealed.
- 7 Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, he or she shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 8.
- 8 Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on 1st July in each year for that year then beginning; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the name of the defaulter may be erased from the List of Fellows. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to rejoin the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription – in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available – or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.
- 9 Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed Proceedings of the Society from the date of election.
- 10 None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
- 11 Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Five members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes one Office-bearer and one elected member of Council.
- 12 The Office-bearers shall consist of a President, three Vice Presidents, and a Treasurer. The Presidents and the Vice Presidents shall be elected for a period of three years. One of the Vice

Presidents shall retire annually by rotation, and shall not be eligible for re-election to the same office until one year has elapsed. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and shall be eligible for re-election. The elections shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.

- 13 The Council shall consist of the Office-bearers, twelve Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North-East Section, the Convenors of the Programme, Publication, Research, Heritage and Finance and Administration Committees if not already elected members, the Society representative on the Ancient Monuments Board (nominated by the Secretary of State for Scotland) and a representative of the National Museums of Scotland who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the Board of Trustees).
- 14 Four of the twelve elected members of Council shall retire annually by rotation, and shall not be eligible for re-election as ordinary members of Council until one year has elapsed. Vacancies among the elected members of Council and Office-bearers occurring by completion of term of office, by retirement on rotation, by resignation, death or otherwise, shall be filled by election at the Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council. The election shall be by ballot, as provided for by Law 12.
- 15 The Council may appoint committees or individual to advise on or to take charge of particular departments of the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.
- 16 The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30 November, or on the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.
- 17 The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
- 18 Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 16, shall be held in each year.
- 19 Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.

Editorial

Fellows will note a change in the internal appearance of the *Proceedings*. During 2000–1 Council approved a proposal to set most of the material in the volume in double columns, rather than a single column across the page. The average number of words to a line in the old design was considered too high for prolonged, comfortable reading. The new design also allows far greater flexibility in the placement of illustrations; whereas an illustration, no matter how small, would use up the whole width of a page in the old style, it can now, where appropriate, fit into a single column. Although design and readability factors were paramount in guiding the change to double-column format, we also believe the new layout will prove more cost-effective. Other than the change to double column we have tried to keep the ‘feel’ of the *Proceedings* the same by maintaining the existing heading and caption styles, and by using the same type sizes for primary and secondary text.

In volume 131 we published three of the papers originally given as part of the 1999–2000 Rhind Lecture series ‘Presenting the Scottish Past’, with an introduction by the President. In volume 132 we publish the remaining three biographical papers, two of which are by the President himself, exploring the work and legacy of four further luminaries of Scottish antiquarian studies.

Gordon J Barclay
Proceedings Editor

Alan Saville
Convener of the Publications Committee