

# The Rhind Lectures 1990–91: a synopsis

## The Revival of Medieval and Early Renaissance architecture in Scotland, 1745–1930

David M Walker\*

### LECTURE 1

#### THE ORIGINS OF THE GOTHIC REVIVAL: THE ARCHITECTURE OF MID GEORGIAN FANTASY, 1745–1820

It could be said that in Scotland the gothic tradition never quite died. The plate traceried windows of Dairsie Kirk (1621), the Y-traceried windows of Balcarres Chapel (1635), the interlaced tracery of Sir William Bruce's church at Lauder (1673), of James Smith's mausoleum at Durrisddeer as first built (1695) and of Michael Kirk, Gordonstoun (1705), carried the gothic tradition through the 17th century and into the 18th.

The gothic revival, or at least the castellated, revival in Scotland arose not so much from the embers of the 16th and 17th century gothic but rather – even though it would have happened in any event – from Sir John Vanbrugh's four-year acquaintance with castellated architecture in its grandest and severest form at Vincennes and the Bastille, which found echoes in the castellated Vanbrugh family houses at Greenwich.

When the 3rd Duke of Argyll succeeded in 1744, his inheritance may have included a scheme for a castellated house similar in outline to the executed castle which Vanbrugh had prepared for the 2nd Duke, although it is now less certain that the inscription on the drawing can be trusted. Another scheme for the 2nd Duke, a Vaubanesque fort with Kentian detail by the engineer Dugald Campbell, provided the idea for the fosse of the executed castle, but the 3rd Duke's choice of architect fell on Roger Morris who had finished Vanbrugh's Eastbury, and it was the plan of that house which was adapted for Inveraray. Eastbury's baroque elevations were redesigned in a gothic manner which derived from the tower James Gibbs had built for the Duke's brother at Whitton, and from such houses as William Kent's remodelling of Esher (1733) and perhaps even Batty Langley's book, *Gothic Architecture Improved* of 1742. Inveraray was the first truly great gothic country house to be built completely anew, although not the first major gothic revival building, that honour being taken by Hawksmoor's All Souls College, Oxford, of 1716–35.

The Duke's executant architects at Inveraray were John and Robert Adam. The style, though not the plan, found echoes at the brothers' unfinished Douglas Castle of 1757–61 and at

\* Historic Scotland, 20 Brandon Street, Edinburgh

their collaborator James Nisbet's Twizell Castle, just across the border in 1771, the latter having the bold machicolated parapets which characterized Robert Adam's later castles.

Contemporary with Twizell was John Baxter and Abraham Roumieux's rebuilding of Gordon Castle, severe Gibbsian baroque with castellated parapets. Adam himself experimented with the fanciful gothic he had employed at Alnwick Castle in 1770–80 only briefly at the façade of Yester Chapel in Scotland, preferring for country house work an Italian inspired castellated which nevertheless has some Scottish references, particularly to James V's tower at Holyroodhouse and, perhaps, his own ruined castle at Dowhill. His earlier essays were, however, more tentative: Mellerstain (c 1770–8), a finely proportioned composition of severe rectangular masses with Tudor hoodmoulds; Wedderburn (1771–5), which has more classical references in its rusticated ground floor but in its bow and towers anticipates the bold geometry of the later castles; and Caldwell (1773), again classical with crenellations and pepperpots. Out of these grew the brilliant geometrical planning of Culzean (begun 1777), Dalquharran (1786), Seton (1789) and Airthrey (1791) in which the detailing, some quatrefoils at Culzean excepted, was severely neo-classical. Some gothic detailing appeared in late works which were probably more James than Robert, at St George's Chapel, Edinburgh, and Stobs Castle (1793). In similar vein were Alexander Stevens' Raehills (1786) the arcaded basement terrace of which anticipates that at Culzean, and Bridge of Dun (1787).

Rather similar in style, though not in plan, was the work of James Playfair at Kinnaird (remodelling, 1785) and Melville (1786) and of Alexander Laing at Darnaway (1802). Robert Adam's former assistants, John Paterson and Richard Crichton, adhered more closely to the style of their master, the former at Monzie (c 1795) Eglinton (1798) and probably Fasque (1809) and the latter at Rossie (c 1800) and probably Gelston (c 1805), most of them with adaptations of Adam plan forms. All these houses had classical interiors: only at Playfair's Farnell Church (1789) and Crichton's Craig Church (1799), both with plaster rib vaults, was significant gothic interior work attempted. All this was in marked contrast to English work of the same period, Horace Walpole's Strawberry Hill having attempted gothic interiors as early as 1753 while convincing neo-Perpendicular work had been achieved at Pomfret Castle, Arlington Street, London, and at Arbury as early as 1756 and 1765 respectively.

The Inveraray-inspired plan-type reappeared at Elliot's Taymouth (1806 onwards) and Newbyth (1817); at James Gillespie Graham's The Lee (1820) and in his original proposals for Duninald; and at William Burn's reconstruction of Saltoun (1818), all with elaborate neo-Gothic interior work. While Saltoun derived more directly from Sir Robert Smirke's Lowther and neo-classical Kinmount, what had brought the Inveraray model back into the consciousness of architects, nobility and gentry alike had been the new palace at Kew, designed by James Wyatt in 1802.

All of these had English Tudor gothic detail, Burn's Saltoun and Gillespie Graham's proposals for Duninald reflecting the increased repertoire of detail available in published form by the second decade of the 19th century. In 1802 the London architect George Saunders produced a precocious scheme for remodelling and largely rebuilding Scone Palace in the 17th century idiom in which it had been built, an exercise perhaps suggested by the tactful neo-Jacobean work which had been carried out in the modernization of many English Elizabethan and Jacobean houses. In the event the Earl of Mansfield paid off Saunders and employed William Atkinson, a pupil of James Wyatt, to transform the old palace into an up-to-date English Tudor gothic pile. It was his first large job on either side of the Border, and unlike its predecessor, it was asymmetrical, enabling the house to be much more logically planned with the principal and private apartments en suite in an L-plan arrangement, privacy

from callers and servants alike being particularly carefully considered. The interiors were modelled on his mentor's Fonthill, albeit on a much smaller scale. Similarly indebted to Wyatt, on this occasion perhaps more to Sheffield Park, was his Rossie Priory (1807) with spirelets borrowed from Peterborough Cathedral. Almost parallel with these were Richard Crichton's conversion from Adam castellated to Tudor gothic at Abercairny Abbey of c 1805, similarly asymmetrical but with rather more literate perpendicular detail, and the London architect James Sands' partly executed schemes for remodelling Torrie House (1813).

John Nash's picturesque castles on the Richard Payne Knight model found Scottish echoes in the London architect Robert Lugar's Tullichewan (1808) and Balloch (1809) and in an important series of rather similar houses by James Gillespie Graham at Culdees (1809), Cambusnethan (1816), Kilmaron (c 1820), the executed design for Duninald (1823) and the much larger and more varied Duns (1818) which incorporated a substantial earlier house.

In church design the sophistication achieved at Farnell and Craig remained unique until the second decade of the new century. In the county parishes and even in the larger towns, 'heritors' gothic' with timber Y-traceried and astragalled windows remained the norm. Some, like Forfar, combined gothic windows with Gibbsian spires but a few of the larger churches, such as John Paterson's St Paul's Perth (1806) attempted more interesting plan forms than the ubiquitous rectangle containing a U-plan gallery.

## LECTURE 2

### SERIOUS GOTHIC REVIVALISM: THE ENGLISH NEO-TUDOR, NEO-JACOBINE AND SCOTS BARONIAL MOVEMENTS: THE REVIVAL OF 'SAXON' OR NEO-NORMAN; AND THE INFLUENCE OF SIR WALTER SCOTT, 1814–40

In the second decade of the 19th century, expectations of architectural scholarship greatly increased, a trend which can be directly linked to John Britton's *Architectural Antiquities* published from 1805 onwards, a book which found a place in most country house libraries and enabled clients as well as architects to be better informed. Its plates gave ready access to gothic detail in a way that Francis Grose's plates had not, and resulted in English gothic, and particularly Tudor gothic, rather than the native gothic which might have been directly observed, becoming as universal in Scotland as it was in England. James Gillespie Graham in Edinburgh and David Hamilton in Glasgow, hitherto still working in a post-Adam castellated idiom at Achnacarry (1802) and Airth (1807) respectively, both moved rapidly into Tudor gothic, Hamilton's work at Crawford Priory (1809) being a notable landmark. But the future of Scottish architecture from 1810 onwards was to lie more in the hands of a group of bright young men newly returned from London. In Aberdeen John Smith was the first to come home in 1804, followed by Archibald Simpson from the offices of Robert Lugar and David Laing in 1813. In Edinburgh William Burn returned from Sir Robert Smirke's in 1811 or 1812, followed by William Henry Playfair from Benjamin Dean Wyatt's and, according to some accounts, Smirke's in 1816.

The new trend was first apparent in church design. In 1813 a correct neo-perpendicular church was built at Collace, its external form being adapted from Britton's plate of Bishop Skirlauch's chapel. Its probable authorship by James Gillespie Graham is not yet confirmed but it inaugurated a long series of churches designed by him on the same model. Essentially similar were David Hamilton's St John's Glasgow (1816) and Larbert (1817) and William

Stirling's Lecropt (1826). Similar again, but less sophisticated in detail with wood tracery, were the more ambitious of John Smith's churches in the north-east from 1821 onwards. Similarly indebted to Britton was Gillespie Graham's parish church at Alloa (1817) with a spire adapted from his plate of Louth, repeated on a much larger scale at Montrose in 1832. Gillespie Graham also set the pace for the most ambitious urban churches of the period with his St Andrew's Roman Catholic chapel in Glasgow (1814) which had a 'college chapel' front, aisled and clerestoried nave and plaster rib vaults. Even more ambitious were two Edinburgh churches built for Episcopal congregations: Archibald Elliot's St Paul's with its fine 'timber' (actually plaster) ceilings and William Burn's St John's with its elaborate plaster fan vaults (both 1816). As originally designed, the tower of St John's was modelled on that designed by Thomas Harrison for St Nicholas, Liverpool (1811), a discriminating choice as few would then be aware of the work of that Chester-based master. A single country church, Kincardine-in-Menteith (1816), by Richard Crichton, attempted the clerestoried nave and aisles formula at the same date but these churches were to remain unique in scale and seriousness of approach for many years.

Richard Crichton's successors, his nephews R & R Dickson, followed up his success at Abercairny with further work there which successfully reorganized its plan on more up-to-date lines, outclassing it with their brilliantly picturesque English Tudor Millearne (1826) which owed much to the client, J G Home-Drummond, but no major opportunity came their way again. James Gillespie Graham lost ground in the mid-1820s but regained position towards the end of the decade. London architects began to penetrate the Scottish market even more seriously than Atkinson had done. Sir Robert Smirke, in addition to his great neo-classical houses at Kinmount, Whittinghame and Newton Don, secured the commissions for the rather old-fashioned neo-Tudor Strathallan Castle (1817), the more up-to-date but very severe Cultoquhey (c 1819), and the triumphantly picturesque Kinfauns (1820) finely sited above the Tay, which adapted the style of his earlier centrally-planned Eastnor to a more up-to-date single aspect plan form with a corridor gallery, much as at the Dicksons' reorganization of Abercairny. His great palace at Erskine (1828), austere symmetrical neo-Tudor externally, is remarkable for its Fonthill-like entrance hall and principal apartments, as splendid as those at Lowther and Eastnor a decade and a half earlier. All would have been put in the shade had Thomas Hopper's Dunkeld Palace, as large as a medieval abbey, gone ahead as planned but it was destined to remain in model form: the executed house (1828), which never got beyond first-floor level, was to have been a severely disciplined Tudor rectangle, distinctly old-fashioned by that date.

Much more influential than Smirke or Hopper were William Wilkins and Edward Blore, who set the style for Burn, the most influential architect of the period. Wilkins' archaeologically correct neo-Tudor houses at Dalmeny (1814) and Dunmore (1820), the former closely modelled on East Barsham in Norfolk, set the style for Burn's Blairquhan (1820), Carstairs (1822), and Garscube (1826); Edward Blore's pioneer Cotswold Tudor revival Corehouse (1824) set the style for Burn's Snaigow designed in the same year, Pitcairns (1827) and a whole series of 'cottage' houses. Stylistically Burn's houses diversified from Tudor to English neo-Jacobean at Dupplin (1828) St Fort (1829) and Kirkmichael (1832) and to a picturesque hybrid Scots-Tudor at Milton Lockhart and the reconstruction of Tynninghame (both 1829); and at Riccarton (1823), Brodie (1824), Lauriston (1827) and Kilconquhar (1831) by incorporating the old tower-houses as the dominant element of the composition, he inaugurated a particularly fashionable Scottish country house profile to achieve which many tower houses were built anew where none had previously existed. To what extent the Scottish features in Burn's houses were influenced by his friend Sir

Walter Scott's Abbotsford – where he was professionally assisted first by Blore and then by Atkinson – rather than his writings is difficult now to say: he did not actually visit Scott there until 1831 though he must have been aware of it earlier.

Burn's Auchmacoy (1831) and his unexecuted designs for Robert Gordon's College, Aberdeen, introduced his Tudor Jacobean style and house planning to the north-east where it was enthusiastically embraced by John Smith at Fintray (1829), Skene (1832), Old Balmoral (1834), Menie (1836), Banchory (1839), the huge Forglen (1840) and finally the rebuilt Balmoral (1852).

Stylistically Balmoral was at least 20 years behind the times, perpetuating the idiom of Milton Lockhart and Tynninghame. Burn himself had moved on. His refitting of James Smith's Drumlanrig from 1829 onwards left the exterior and the principal interiors much as he found them, enriched only by geometrically ribbed Jacobean ceilings, when first Atkinson and then Charles Barry had planned to transform it, the latter as a French château. He was markedly less respectful of Smith's subsequent Dutch Palladianism at Dalkeith House for which in 1831 he produced two schemes for transforming it into a Jacobean prodigy house, neither of which got beyond the outstandingly fine model made by George Meikle Kemp. Madras College, St Andrews (1832), a fine quadrangle with miniature Wollaton towers, illustrates what it would have been like on a much smaller scale.

In 1834 Burn broke into the English market with the commission to complete Anthony Salvin's Harlaxton, Lincolnshire. It introduced him to a range of neo-Jacobean detailing far beyond what he could glean from Britton's *Architectural Antiquities*. His work there consisted of lodges, garden buildings and interior work but his greatly increased vocabulary was reflected in his sophisticated neo-Jacobean Falkland and Whitehill (both 1839), Stoke Rochford (1841) and Revesby (1844) both in Lincolnshire and with much more sophisticated interior work, some of it German baroque, than anything attempted previously. Similar strides were made in his Scots revival houses from his addition to Castle Menzies (1836–40) onwards, culminating in highly sophisticated Scots Jacobean houses such as Preston, West Lothian (1840). In 1844 he moved his practice to London where he became not William Burn architect, but William Burn Esq, leaving his pupil and partner David Bryce in charge of the Edinburgh office. In London he came across the English architect-antiquary, Robert William Billings, and financed that most influential of all Scottish architectural books, *The Baronial and Ecclesiastical Antiquities of Scotland*.

Although Burn attempted to introduce the 16th-century Scottish idiom to England at the vast Franco-Scottish scheme for Fonthill, the chief beneficiary of Billings' labours was to be Bryce. The formal end of the partnership was in 1850, but even before that date Burn's outstandingly fine Poltalloch (1849) had been designed from his London office. His last Scottish houses, Buchanan (1852: a reduced plate-glass version of the Fonthill design), Balintore (1859) and Polmaise (1863) were all in the Scots 16th century idiom.

Burn's success was, however, founded on his expertise in house planning rather than mastery of period styles. His skill in the disposition of masses enabled him to produce carefully planned enfilades of principal and private apartments, the latter usually forming an identifiable private wing, with an ever-increasing emphasis on privacy from callers and servants, skilfully developing a house plan concept first seen in Scotland at Mellerstain.

Although Gillespie Graham's career as country house architect had been eclipsed by Burn's in the early 1820s, he nevertheless produced some domestic work of extraordinary quality. From 1829 he built, evidently with some help from A W N Pugin, the great symmetrical-fronted Jacobean palace of Murthly which sadly remained unfinished. In 1838 he recast the surviving William Adam wing at Taymouth, building the Banner Hall to link it with

the main block which was greatly enriched by superb woodwork and painted decoration, again with the help of Pugin and the London decorator J G Grace, the final ensemble being the most magnificent suite of gothic apartments in the United Kingdom. Pugin was similarly involved in the unexecuted scheme of 1836 for the restoration of Holyrood Abbey, the design of Victoria Hall (latterly Tolbooth St John's) on Edinburgh's Castle Hill in 1841, and the remodelling of Brodick Castle in 1844, although the executed interior work does not correspond with the surviving drawings. Its style was echoed in his last major work, Ayton Castle (1851).

William Henry Playfair similarly received far fewer commissions than Burn, but all were of great quality. The biaxial planning of the great Elizabethan palace he built at Brownlow, Lurgan, Northern Ireland (1833), excelled anything then built by Burn in picturesque quality if not convenience, while the skilful Scots Jacobean of his remodelling of Grange and Prestongrange (both 1830) and his new-build Stonefield (1836), far excelled anything then built by Burn in terms of mastery of detail.

Playfair's most ambitious works were, however, the neo-Jacobean remodelling and enlargement of William Adam's Floors (1837) in a Heriot's Hospital inspired idiom with, rather surprisingly, Tudor hoodmoulds at the windows. Wholly English Elizabethan were his schemes for Donaldson's Hospital, the greatest Scottish building project of the age. The first scheme, a gigantic H-plan with cloistral arcaded screens closing the courts, drew inspiration from Rickman's St John's College buildings at Cambridge. Echoes of it appeared in David Rhind's Daniel Stewart's College (1848) and at Archibald Simpson's Marischal College, Aberdeen (1837), where the screen proposal was quickly discarded. The plan form of the latter derived more from Wilkins' Grecian University College London. Playfair's final quadrangular scheme for Donaldson's, many times revised, was the result of a limited competition on which C R Cockerell appears to have advised.

Other architects to show particular skill in the neo-Jacobean idiom were David Hamilton at Dunlop (1831); Burn's ex-assistant George Smith at the great tenemental terrace of Melbourne Place, Edinburgh (1840) and John Baird – with the assistance of Alexander Thomson – in the abortive schemes for the new University of Glasgow at Woodlands Hill (1846). In the same idiom but strongly tinged with continental influence was the reconstruction and enlargement of Dunrobin, where the Duke of Sutherland and the contractor-architect William Leslie rearranged Sir Charles Barry's original scheme to fit the site in consultation with him from 1845 onwards. Inspired at least in part by Scott's novel *Ivanhoe*, and perhaps more directly by Hopper's Gosford in Northern Ireland and Penrhyn in Wales, were Charles Barry's unexecuted schemes for remodelling Drummond, David Hamilton's Lennox (1837) and R & R Dickson's small but brilliantly picturesque addition to Dunimarle (1840).

Neo-Norman also figures in some church designs of the period, most notably at James Gillespie Graham's Parish Church at Erroll (1831) and Chapel of St Anthony the Eremita at Murthly (1846), Thomas Hamilton's large parish church at Alyth (1839), John Henderson's North Church at Stirling (1841) and David Cousin's St Thomas's Church of England and St Cuthbert's Free Church in Edinburgh (both 1843). William Burn also adopted it in a simple form at Morton Church (1839) and a number of smaller country churches, but by the late 1830s he had come to prefer Early English, most notably at West Church, Dalkeith (1840), and Langholm (1842), venturing into mid-Decorated with late 15th-century Scottish arcades in his remarkable rebuilding of St Mary's Parish Church, Dundee (1844), which drew upon his experiences in reconstructing St Giles, Edinburgh, in 1829. The early Decorated style favoured by the Tractarian movement made a pioneer appearance at Thomas Rickman's St David's Ramshorn, Glasgow (1824), but elsewhere the neo-perpendicular style introduced to

Scotland by Gillespie Graham, Elliot and Burn in the second decade of the century remained the norm for better-class church design throughout the country, the most common type being the single-span rectangle masked by a 'nave and aisles' front in which the 'aisles' demarcated the gallery stairs. It served for all the presbyterian denominations, Catholics and Episcopalians alike, with differences only in the disposition of the gallery and furnishing. Georgian neo-perpendicular church design culminated in James Brown's 'United Presbyterian Cathedral', the Westminster gothic Renfield Street Church in Glasgow of 1849.

### LECTURE 3

#### NATIONALISM: SCOTTISH BARONIAL, SCOTS JACOBAN AND THE LATE GOTHIC AND EARLY RENAISSANCE OF THE AULD ALLIANCE, 1840-80

Although the revival of Scottish 16th- and early 17th-century motifs as the style commonly known as Scottish baronial was so largely his creation, Sir Walter Scott did not live to see it develop much beyond Burn's Scots-Tudor. His own 200-foot monument, the result of a competition eventually won by Burn's self-taught assistant, George Meikle Kemp, was still gothic with a profile which, as Thomas Hamilton unkindly pointed out having drawn on it himself at his unexecuted Knox Church project on Edinburgh's Castle Hill in 1829, derived at least partly from Antwerp. It also seems to be, to some extent, of German Romantic origin, the top of its spire as first designed being closely related to a much smaller monument by Schinkel in Berlin. Although its lower details were Scottish Gothic from Melrose Abbey, its importance as an expression of Scott's contribution to Scotland's national identity was more symbolic. Nothing like it, least of all to a literary figure, had ever been built before.

In the 220-foot Wallace Monument at Stirling built by a committee of nationalists to the designs of the Glasgow architect J T Rothead in 1859, Scottishness was much more unequivocally expressed. Its immensely robust crown spire was the first really serious attempt at the revival of the late Scots gothic forms not found elsewhere in Europe.

Bold though the Scots baronial detailing of the remainder of the building was, there was nothing new about it. Scots baronial was already well established as the national style of the Scottish landed gentry, the Scottish equivalent of the gothic, Tudor and Jacobean favoured south of the Border. Robert William Billings himself designed the great castle at Wemyss Bay (1853 and 1874) and the reconstruction of the castle at Dalziel, but his strange hard-edged geometric version of Scots baronial had far less influence than his finely-drawn steel engravings. The premier exponent of the style was Burn's partner David Bryce. Once Burn was in London from 1844, Bryce quickly developed his own characteristic style while retaining, in an updated form, Burn's well-tryed plan-types. At Inchdairnie (1845) many of the elements of his mature style were already evident, the garden front having his characteristic canted bays corbelled to the square. Rather smaller but skilfully composed and progressively bolder in composition were Stronvar (1850), Kimmerghame (1851) and Hartridge (1854), the last adopting features from that favourite Bryce model, Maybole Castle. In his largest houses the dominant element was invariably a tower house built anew which contained the main entrance, Maybole being the model used at The Glen (1855), Fotheringham (1859) and New Gala (1872). The round tower at Castle Fraser was another Bryce favourite, providing the entrance tower at Birkhill (1855), the giant Ballikinrain (1864) and Castlemilk (1863), while Newark provided that at Broadstone (1869), and Fyvie those at Craighends (1859) and Blair

Castle (1870). Pinkie was another favourite, appearing at Eaglesham (1859) as was Winton at Portmore (1850) and Halleaths (1866). Except at Blair, where a conscious effort was made to recover the former silhouette of the castle, never was there any intention of recapturing the character of ancient work so completely that the visitor might be deceived, as there was with many of Devey's houses south of the Border. Except in a few houses which incorporated older work and were harled to match, notably Keiss (1862), Cullen (1858) and the giant Cortachy (1872) Bryce took the straightforward approach of building unmistakably 19th-century plan forms in equally unmistakable 19th-century masonry.

Bryce also has an important place in UK architectural history as one of the pioneers of the introduction of the French *château* manner, a development which was doubtless held to be historically justified by the Auld Alliance. From 1854 he reconstructed Playfair's Kinnaird as a vast symmetrical French *château* with high pavilion roofs which also appeared at Eastburgh, Herts, built anew in 1858, and in his reconstructions of Georgian houses at Belladrum (1858), Inverardoch (1859) and Meikleour (1869), the last alas much simplified from what was originally intended. Fettes College, Edinburgh (1864–70) was his supreme achievement in that manner, outclassing even the premier French master of the genre, the Angevin architect René Hodé. The entrance tower was adapted from the Fyvie model but the other elements were drawn mainly from Blois. Bryce did not, however, attempt early French Renaissance interiors, those at Kinnaird being neo-Jacobean, essentially similar in character to those of his baronial houses.

Bryce was similarly an accomplished master of neo-Jacobean, Scots at his remodelling of Panmure in 1852, and English in the huge Langton, a very sophisticated house built anew from 1862, which challenged Salvin and Devey at their very best.

The Franco-Scottish style of Fettes, adapted in a much less expensive form by Bryce himself for the new Edinburgh Royal Infirmary (1870), immediately attracted a substantial following, notably his pupils Charles G H Kinnear of Peddie & Kinnear and James Campbell Walker. Kinnear adopted it at the Morgan Hospital, Dundee, and at Aberdeen Municipal Buildings (both 1866); Walker at the town halls at Dunfermline (1875) and Hawick (1883). Another skilful exponent of the Franco-Scottish was James Maitland Wardrop, a pupil of Thomas Brown, who may perhaps have spent some time at Bryce's. He reconstructed Callendar Park in a François Ier based manner between 1869 and 1877, and built Stirling Courthouse anew in the idiom in 1874, omitting the Fettes-type tower originally intended.

Like Bryce, these architects were primarily exponents of the Scottish baronial manner. Walker built the colossal Blair Drummond, modelling it to some degree on Burn's unbuilt Fonthill design. Kinnear built many houses in the Bryce manner, the best being the rather similar houses at Kinnettes (1864) and Glenmayne (1869) and a complete Edinburgh street, Cockburn Street (1859), which set the style for David Cousin and John Lessels' Improvement Act architecture in St Mary's Street. Bryce himself built in the baronial idiom at St Giles' Street in the Old Town in 1872. He extended its use to suburban terraces at Marchmont where only a fragment of his scheme was realised although the spirit of it was continued by lesser hands. Of Bryce's followers much the most important was Wardrop. His first really large house was Lochinch (1861), still very much in Bryce's manner but with some individual French touches of its own, as befitted a house built for a French noblewoman. At the equally large Stitchill (1866) he generally followed the Fonthill/Buchanan model but with some skilful borrowings from Barry's Dunrobin, his simpler, slightly understated, style being every bit as successful as Bryce at his best. Most remarkable of all was his massive enlargement of the early

16th-century tower house at Nunraw (1868), its immensely solid walls and small fenestration being convincingly late medieval in form to a degree never previously attempted; and although less consciously neo-medieval, his Beaufort built in the early 1880s has a massive grandeur which can make some of Bryce's houses look too cut up and overdesigned. Another particularly thoughtful design by Wardrop was Kinnordy (1879) where he adopted the early 17th-century domestic style of Pinkie, towers and angle turrets being entirely omitted. By 1882 when he and his son Hew Montgomerie Wardrop were offering sketch designs for remodelling The Hirsell they had moved away from the baronial idiom and 'Queen Anne' was one of the options. Rowand Anderson, who absorbed their practice, learned much from the Wardrops at his own Allermuir (1880) and Glencoe (1895).

John Lessels, a much older man than Wardrop or Kinnear, was another Burn pupil who excelled in the idiom at Salisbury Green House (1866), much more delicately detailed than the slightly later St Leonard's Hall (1869) nearby. He in turn was the early master of David MacGibbon, later of MacGibbon and Ross fame, who, after a spell with Burn in London, was commissioned to give the National Bank of Scotland a suitably nationalistic architectural identity in the fine Scots baronial banks at Alloa, Falkirk and Forfar (all 1861–2), a lead followed by Charles Kinnear in a large number of branch offices for the Bank of Scotland and the Royal Bank of Scotland.

Two Perth pupils of Burn and Bryce, Andrew Heiton II and David Smart, established the Bryce idiom in the east of Scotland. Heiton's early Dunalastair (1852), although strictly symmetrical, otherwise followed Bryce's style closely but his later houses show a similar asymmetry to Bryce's as at Orchill (1868) and Bonskeid (1881). Some of his later houses show other influences, such as that of Peddie & Kinnear's Kinmonth at Kinbrae, Newport (1872), or German castles as at Ravenscraig, West Ferry (1874) and Druidsmere (1887). His reputation extended far beyond Perthshire, his best surviving houses being at Giffen at Ayrshire (1869) and Vogrie, Midlothian (1875). Smart's work, as at Balhousie (1864) and Erigmore, Birnam (1862), is indistinguishable from Bryce's.

The Glasgow, Aberdeen and Inverness architects had rather more of an identity of their own. The baronial Campbell warehouse on Ingram Street, Glasgow was by Billings himself (1854) but Rothead quickly followed his lead in the lively City of Glasgow Bank buildings he built on Trongate. Charles Wilson, normally a classical designer, excelled at Lochton (1852) and St Helens, Dundee (1850), and James Smith at the enormous Overtoun, Dumbarton (1860), which has lavish Italian interior work by J Moyr Smith. The premier Glasgow exponents of the Scots baronial country house were, however, Campbell Douglas at Hartfield, Cove (1859), and Greystane near Dundee (1870) and John Burnet Senior who designed the formidable Auchendennan (1867), Arden (1866) and Kilmahew (c 1870), all of which show a markedly different personality from Bryce's.

In the north-east Thomas Mackenzie benefited from a close association with Billings when he was sketching in the area, reflected in his skilful restorations at Cawdor and Ballindalloch. He died early in 1854, leaving the field to his partner James Matthews, a much more hard-edged designer, a typical example of whose work can be seen at Ardo (1877).

Matthews' partner in Inverness, William Lawrie, was a better designer. His Aigas (1877) is closer to the Kinnear model, if less robust in the detailing. In sheer scale, however, it was outclassed by Alexander Ross's colossal Ardrross (1880) and in sheer eccentricity, if nothing else, by John Rhind's Ardverikie (1873).

## LECTURE 4

## HIGH VICTORIAN GOTHIC, 1845–90

The progression of the gothic revival from the neo-perpendicular churches, country houses and collegiate buildings of the reigns of George IV and William IV to correct Early Decorated and Early English forms drawn from the wide range of published material, including A W N Pugin's own designs for modern churches, was at first primarily a markedly upper-class Episcopal Church movement. Secular clients continued to prefer Renaissance, neo-classical and baronial models. But although many congregations, particularly United Presbyterian ones, continued to prefer classical models as being without Episcopal or Catholic connotations, the Early Decorated style of the Tractarian movement was gradually adopted by presbyterian denominations and towards the end of the century, episcopal church planning had a considerable influence on presbyterian church design.

Tractarian gothic was a development more associated with a new generation of architects rather than with established figures. David Bryce could be a skilful designer in gothic as may be seen at his reconstruction of St Nicholas, Dalkeith (1851), and at his Flemish gothic Royal Exchange at Dundee (1855). So could his partner Burn, as can be seen at the Episcopal Chapel of St Mary, also at Dalkeith, built 1844–54. But the Scottish leader of the movement, as against the major London architects invited across the Border, was John Henderson, a pupil of Thomas Hamilton. The contrast between the hybrid spire he added to the parish church at Arbroath in 1839 to his pure English Early Decorated St Mary's Episcopal Church (1847) in the same town is marked indeed. Henderson was, however, rarely entrusted with really large churches despite his obvious success at Trinity College, Glenalmond (begun 1843), where he built a great Oxford college in the Perthshire countryside, the completion of which fell to George Gilbert Scott.

Scott was not the first major Tractarian architect to cross the Border. That distinction belongs to William Butterfield who made his *début* rather earlier with a minor work, St John's School, Jedburgh (1844), before going on to design the Cathedral of the Isles on Cumbrae and St Ninian's Episcopal Cathedral at Perth, both begun in 1849 and financed by the Hon G F Boyle, later the Earl of Glasgow. Benjamin Ferrey was the next to make an appearance at Holy Cross, Melrose, in 1846. Scott made his first serious appearance at Dundee six years later with the tall-spired church (later Cathedral) of St Paul, the continental hall church nave and aisleless apse of which has echoes of his *Nicholaikirche* scheme for Hamburg. His ex-assistants, William Hay and Henry Edward Coe, secured further commissions in the same years. Hay designed the very original saddleback towered church of St John at Longside, and Coe three remarkable buildings at Dundee: the giant Tudor collegiate Infirmary (1852); the 15th century English manorial Farington Hall (1853); and the episcopal church of St Mary Magdalene, not large but notable for its adoption of the so-called Gerona plan, in which the nave encompassed the width of the chancel and its aisles, a plan form which was to be particularly significant in Scottish church design later.

The Roman Catholic Church was a major builder of Pugin-inspired churches in much the same vein but had no equivalent to John Henderson. Nearly all its major commissions went across the Border. A W N Pugin never built the cathedral planned for Edinburgh but – illicitly – he did design the Catholic Apostolic Church in Glasgow (1852). His son Edward built St Mary's, Leith (1852), and the much finer church at Glenfinnan (1873); Joseph Hansom St David's, Dalkeith (1853), and St Mary's, Lochee, Dundee (1865), the latter a very original

design with an octagonal tower chancel like his St Wilfrid's at Ripon; William Wardell the Immaculate Conception, Kelso (1857) and the much more ambitious Our Lady and St Andrew's, Galashiels (1856); and George Goldie St Mary's, Lanark (1856, largely rebuilt since), Our Lady of the Garioch and St John's, Fetternear (1859), and the unfinished St Mungo's, Townhead, Glasgow (1866), and St Mary's, Greenock (1862). Deeply sensitive of his honour as a church designer, the Rt Rev James Kyle, Bishop of the Northern District, rose to the challenge at the twin-spired St Peter's, Buckie (1857), a dramatic change from his basic Georgian gothic chapels of a few years earlier.

Rather surprisingly, the newly-established Free Church, which had initially rushed up very cheap gothic and Italianate churches to standard plans, proved an important patron of Tractarian architecture, at least so far as external appearances were concerned. In the 1850s the wealthier congregations began to replace them with edifices which would be a visible challenge to the Established Church. The architects particularly favoured were John, James Murdoch and William Hardie Hay, Borderers who had settled in Liverpool. Their South Church, Stirling (1851), had tall arcades and a clerestory but more usually their churches are wide single-span structures with laminated timber trusses which externally look as if they might have a nave and aisles under an overall roof. They excelled in the design of spires, ranging from the orthodox but excellently profiled Well Park, Greenock (1853), to the very original Buccleuch and Greyfriars Church, Edinburgh (1856) and former St Columba's, Brechin (1855). The last of these also shows a very original use of materials being built of polygonally squared 'land stones' and roofed with very large slates. Equally innovative was their small Anglo-Saxon Church at Tarfside (1859) which was built of herringbone masonry.

J T Emmet was another English architect who built for presbyterian congregations. His churches, Bath Street Independent Church (1849), Glasgow, Wilton Church, Hawick (1861), since enlarged, and Sandyford Church, Glasgow (1854), were all directly inspired by Pugin inside and out, but their influence at the time was slight.

By the 1860s some congregations of the Free and United Presbyterian church had acquired stronger tastes in their desire to express their triumph over the Established Church. These were met by Frederick Thomas Pilkington, the son of a Stamford Methodist architect Thomas Pilkington who had moved his practice to Scotland in 1853. Frederick studied first at Edinburgh University and then after three years of designing quite innovative houses such as Broomhill, Burntisland (1858) and Inchglas, Crieff (1859), toured the continent and recommenced practice in 1861, exhibiting ideal preaching church designs in a Ruskin-inspired Franco-Italian gothic with strongly textured stonework tinged with polychromy. Astonishingly he found congregations, which only a decade or two earlier had been scared to have even a bell, adventurous enough to finance these gargantuan buildings with fantastic roof structures and unfamiliar plan forms, truncated diamonds at Trinity, Irvine (1861), Penicuik South (1862) and St John's, Kelso (1865) and apple-shaped at Barclay, Edinburgh (1862). All of these were characterized by the big-scaled naturalistic carving of the Oxford Museum school, much of it sculpted by a Mr Pearce. Pilkington's domestic architecture was equally uncompromising as at Woodslee (1862), the vast Glassingal (1864), Stoneyhill (1868), and the fine Romanesque Hydropathic at Moffat (1876).

In Glasgow the key figures were John Honeyman who had returned from Burn's office in London in 1856, J J Stevenson who returned from Scott's in the late 1850s and William Leiper who had returned from the London practices of J L Pearson and William White. Each had a different solution to the problem of preaching church design. At St Mark's, Greenbank, Greenock (1861) and at the tall-spired Lansdowne Church, Glasgow (1862), Honeyman

adopted wide naves with passage aisles screened off by panelling. At Charlotte Street, Glasgow, and his tall-spired Park Church at Helensburgh (both 1862) he adopted the Puginian triple-aisled plan of Emmet's Sandyford, little different from his own Anglican St Silas, Glasgow (1863), but, as originally fitted out, all with central pulpits. In these churches perhaps he foresaw how the liturgy of the Church of Scotland would change. Stevenson's Italian Gothic Kelvinside Church (1862) represented a more typical solution to the problem, little different in principle from Renfield, with slim cast-iron columned arcades bearing galleries at mid shaft. Rather similar internally was James Salmon's elaborately polychrome interior at Anderston, Glasgow (1864), in which his son William Forrest, who was, like Stevenson, an assistant of G G Scott, probably had a hand. Both churches reflected the influence of G E Street rather than Scott. Leiper's Downhill Church, Glasgow (1865), reflected his stay at Pearson's in its fine Northamptonshire spire, but the problem of providing a large preaching space for a United Presbyterian congregation was overcome by adopting the wide hammerbeam roof of E W Godwin's Northampton Town Hall.

By the early 1870s such solutions had ceased to satisfy the more aesthetically-minded congregations. At Camphill, Glasgow (1875), another UP church, memorable for its great Normandy gothic spire reminiscent of Pearson's at St Augustine's, Kilburn, London, Leiper sacrificed the single-span uninterrupted vision of Downhill to the insertion of good masonry arcades with galleries in the aisles. At Anderston Free (1876) and Belhaven UP (1877), Glasgow, James Sellars went further and sacrificed the gallery to a clerestory. For those who still preferred an unbroken preaching space the Sante Chapelle in Paris provided a model at Sellars' Hillhead Established Church (1875) and Robert Baldie's long-destroyed Kelvinside UP Church (1879) both in west-end Glasgow.

Wide preaching churches were not, however, peculiar to Presbyterian congregations. G G Scott had provided a broad nave and an apse on the Italian friars' church model at Leith in 1861. So had the Rev Frederick George Lee and Alexander Ellis, it is said with the assistance of a scheme by G E Street, at their polychrome Italian gothic St Mary's Episcopal Church, Aberdeen, in 1862. Scott's executant architect at St James had been his ex-assistant Robert Rowand Anderson who largely succeeded to the Scottish episcopal church building connections of John Henderson when he died in 1862, notably at the James Brooks-like All Saints, Brougham Place, Edinburgh (1865) and St Andrew's Church, St Andrews (1866), both with orthodox Tractarian plans. But at the giant Catholic Apostolic Church, Edinburgh (begun 1873), he adopted the friars' church plan of a broad nave embracing the width of the chancel and its aisles, which, in a more developed form, provided the answer when the Scoto-Catholic minister of Govan, the Rev John Macleod, sought a solution to the problem of getting beauty into presbyterian worship with a preaching church in which the communion table was set up in the chancel in the same central position as an episcopal altar. Govan (1883) provided the model for J J Burnet's equally fine Barony Church, Glasgow (1886), and Anderson's own St Paul's at Greenock (1890). The plan type quickly spread to the Free Church at Hippolyte Blanc's St Luke's, West Ferry (1884) and Perth Middle Church (1887). Within a few years the influence of Macleod's movement, and of the Aberdeen, soon to become the Scottish, Ecclesiological Society, resulted in the building of many more presbyterian churches on the same model with an increasing tendency to Scots medieval forms.

Despite his undisputed standing as the premier Episcopal church designer in Scotland, Anderson was *not* among those invited to compete for the greatest Scottish church building project of the age, St Mary's Cathedral in Edinburgh in which the Scottish architects competing against Scott, Burges and Street in 1872 were the architects to the Walker estate

which financed it, John Lessels and Peddie & Kinnear. The Inverness architect Alexander Ross, author of the twin-towered Cathedral of St Andrew at Inverness (1866), was also invited, submitting a design largely by his London collaborator, George Freeth Roper. The assessor, Ewan Christian, recommended Street, but the chosen design, perhaps wisely, was that of Scott. The second great church building commission of the age, the Coats Memorial Church at Paisley, also eluded both Anderson and Burnet. Anderson was not among those selected to compete and the assessor, James Sellars, awarded the Commission to Blanc in 1885. As at St Mary's the deciding factor was clearly a cathedral-like image with a great central tower. Where Anderson and Burnet had solved the problem of the wide preaching church nave straightforwardly, Blanc solved it by architectural sleight of hand, in taking his oblong crossing to a square crown tower at roof level.

Anderson's supreme gothic triumphs were to be secular. Gothic had not been much adopted for secular architecture in Scotland except by English architects, notably Sir G G Scott at the Albert Institute, Dundee (1865) a fragment of his unbuilt Hamburg Rathaus project, and the University of Glasgow (1864–70) where a London-Oxford establishment caucus in the university's Removal Committee had passed over the local profession, partly in the interests of speed of construction. It is a much better building than it is generally given credit for which a very remarkable use of structural ironwork in the Bute Hall, Museum and former Library and the staircases associated with them. Although Scott persuaded his clients that it was Scottish 13th-century gothic – and there are echoes of Glasgow Cathedral chapter house – the origins of the tower and some of its other features are really Flemish. Gothic country houses were similarly rare and by English architects, most notably Matthew Habershon's Duncrub (1870) and George Edmund Street's great Romanesque library and chapel at Dunecht which was built throughout the 1870s. Anderson apart, by far the best Scottish exponent of secular gothic was Leiper, notably at the Burges/Godwin-like Dumbarton Town Hall (1865) and the fine mansion of The Elms, Arbroath (1869). Still more indebted to Burges was John Burnet Senior's Glasgow Stock Exchange, the French gothic elevations of which drew heavily on Burges's competition designs for the Strand Law Courts in London which he was able to study by courtesy of his younger brother William, architectural clerk to the competition. It was part of a minor vogue for gothic public buildings in the 1870s. William Lawrie's Town Hall at Inverness (1878) was a much smaller building in similar vein, Andrew Heiton's Municipal Buildings at Perth (1877) followed Alfred Waterhouse's gothic model in a rather dryer monochrome form. Waterhouse's romanescque provided the inspiration for John Macleod's Christian Institute, Glasgow (1878), which in its final vast towered form was the work of Clarke & Bell and R A Bryden as late as 1895–8.

At the great palace of Mount Stuart (1878–86) for that extraordinary patron the 3rd Marquess of Bute, and at the combined Scottish National Portrait Gallery and National Museum in Edinburgh (1884–9) financed by John Ritchie Findlay, Sir Rowand Anderson put all these in the shade. There was very nearly a third major building in the group, the Caledonian Railway Offices in Gordon Street, Glasgow (1877), but an early Renaissance design was eventually preferred. That Anderson should have returned to his study tour of early gothic houses in France and Italy for inspiration after his success with the early North Italian Renaissance Medical School at Edinburgh University is surprising, and may well have been the Marquess of Bute's preference rather than his own. He had Burges's work for the Marquess at Cardiff to live up to and he rose to the occasion magnificently, the details of Mount Stuart being refined over a period of some 20 years and culminating in the chapel (1897–1902) with its Spanish gothic lantern.

The Portrait Gallery and National Museum was not so expensive a building as Mount Stuart. The square central halls have a certain similarity but in the Edinburgh building the vaults were omitted, historical murals being provided by William Hole from 1895 onwards. But the overall form of the building, especially as originally planned with circular conical-roofed corner towers – angle spires were substituted to avoid complications of room shape – was more adventurous and the sculptural treatment, achieved over a long period by the premier Scottish sculptors, altogether richer. Its anglicized Doge's Palace-like elevations with blind top floor and the general arrangement may owe something to Russel Sturgis's Fine Art Institute in Boston, USA, but Anderson's treatment is altogether more accomplished with a central entrance bay inspired by Italian gothic tombs. Taken together, Mount Stuart and the Findlay Building marked the supreme achievement of the mainstream 'early decorated' school of Gothic revival design in Scotland.

## LECTURE 5

### NEW TRENDS: CONTINENTAL EARLY RENAISSANCE, INFLUENCES FROM THE USA, FREESTYLE LATE GOTHIC AND THE ARTS & CRAFTS MOVEMENT, 1875–1929

Until the mid-1870s the development of the revival of medieval and Early Renaissance architecture had not been particularly complicated. There had been gothic, mainly English but with occasional experiments with French and Italian in the 1860s; neo-Norman in the 1830s, '40s and '50s and less frequently later; Scottish Baronial with occasional ventures into the French *château* manner from which it was thought to originate; and Jacobean, both English and Scottish.

Towards the end of the century there was a much wider search of the continent for new and unfamiliar motifs. It was a United Kingdom development which reflected the increasing familiarity of the well-to-do with western and southern Europe. Different styles were integrated and sometimes even contrasted in the same building. The first portent of it had perhaps been Charles Wilson's Free Church College, Glasgow, of 1859–61. Well within the classic tradition and indeed inspired by the Italian *cinquecento* work of the Munich and Berlin classicists, it nevertheless had a soaring tower which was secular Italian medieval in outline: Schinkel had done something of the sort at the Zittau Rathaus, but it still foreshadowed the 'bargello gothic' which made occasional appearances, particularly in the industrial work of W F MacGibbon some 30 years later. Also markedly Germanic in origin and indeed directly associated with Prince Albert's own tastes in architecture and design was the Royal Scottish Museum, Edinburgh (1861). The disciplined North Italian early Renaissance façade Captain Francis Fowke had designed to screen the Crystal Palace-inspired South Kensington exhibition halls within was unusual at the time in having touches of polychromy at its red sandstone colonnettes. The Edinburgh Office of Works apparently did not like it. Robert Matheson made several attempts to redesign it in an orthodox High Renaissance manner but the will of South Kensington prevailed.

The Royal Scottish Museum had little impact on Scottish architecture at the time but when, in 1874, the University of Edinburgh held a limited competition for a new Medical School and a graduation hall Rowand Anderson's choice of style was North Italian early Renaissance albeit of a very different kind from Fowke's, only partly symmetrical and with a far more generous

proportion of wall to openings. The immediate inspiration was again probably German: Anderson had travelled across Europe from Paris to Berlin, Leipzig and Aachen. But unlike Fowke, who systematized the style to answer the iron frames within, Anderson showed far more direct observation of original North Italian architecture; S Zaccaria at Venice for the entrance bay, San Marco at Venice for the unbuilt campanile, the Palazzo Fava at Bologna for the consoles of the corbelled arcade in the court. It was an extremely accomplished performance, outside and in. Nothing quite like it had been built in Britain before.

As set out in the fourth lecture, Anderson's original plans for the Caledonian Railway's buildings at Glasgow's Central Station had been Mount Stuart gothic. By February 1878 they had been redesigned in an eclectic early Renaissance manner with early Italian second-floor windows, northern European-looking mullioned and transomed upper windows, tall Low Countries/Scandinavian gables and a very Scandinavian tower, all skilfully welded together into a unified design.

These developments in Anderson's style relate interestingly to assistants and partners. The Medical School found an echo in St Aloysius College on Glasgow's Garnethill (1883), designed by Archibald MacPherson, his assistant from 1873 to 1876. In Anderson's partnership with George Washington Browne, formed in 1881, the Edinburgh, Glasgow and London schools at last merged. Browne had originally been a pupil of Salmon's, then a trusted assistant of Campbell Douglas and Sellars in 1873–5 before making the predictable transfer to the office of J J Stevenson, Douglas's former partner, where he learned the so-called 'Queen Anne' manner. Thereafter he made a still more advantageous transfer to W Eden Nesfield's after a continental study tour in 1878. He must have arrived at Anderson's just a little too late to have had made influence on the design of the Central Station as a whole though no doubt he spent much time refining the details. It was very much the sort of design he would have made himself as can be seen from the superb Flemish Renaissance tearoom he built for Miss Cranston in Glasgow's Buchanan Street in 1896, and from the many early Renaissance Royal and British Linen Bank offices he built during his later partnership with J M Dick Peddie. Browne excelled particularly in the François Ier manner as can be seen at the Central Library, Edinburgh (1887–90), which drew heavily on such sources as Moret, the Hôtel d'Ecoville at Caen and Saint Germain-en-Laye, and the former British Linen Bank on Edinburgh's George Street (1905). In time, Browne's old master, Sellars, came to be influenced by Anderson and Browne as can be seen at his last work, Anderson's College of Medicine, Glasgow (1888), which has some echoes of Anderson's Medical School.

An important architect trained in the Anderson & Browne office was A G Sydney Mitchell, who secured the patronage of John Ritchie Findlay and the great mental institutions through his father, Sir Arthur Mitchell. In 1883 he built Findlay's handsome early Renaissance house at 3 Rothesay Terrace, Edinburgh, together with the brilliantly picturesque Scots 17th-century fantasy of Well Court. Its Earl's Palace type oriels were repeated at his reconstruction of Glenkindie House. His were some of the greatest commissions of the age: great castles and country houses such as Duntreath (1890), Sauchieburn (1891) and the towering Wagnerian fantasy of Glenborrodale (1898). His best work was the colossal early Renaissance Craig House and its chatelets (1889), all superbly set on the hillside at Craiglockhart, a luxurious hydropathic for the well-to-do deranged.

In 1883 Rowand Anderson & Browne merged their practice with that of Hew Montgomerie Wardrop who had been left on his own at the age of 26 by the deaths of his father James Maitland Wardrop and his partner Charles Reid. It was a meeting of like minds: the younger Wardrop was now working in a London-inspired 'Queen Anne' manner very much akin to Browne's as can be seen at his reconstruction of Ballochmyle in 1886–8. He was also an early arts and craftsman in the

George Devey tradition as can be seen in his immensely tactful additions to the ancient Place of Tilliefour (1884) where Robert Lorimer was his site architect.

Lorimer found Wardrop more sympathetic than Anderson and did not stay after Wardrop's early death in 1888. Thereafter he worked in London with G F Bodley from whom he learned much in both the ecclesiastical and domestic fields: he met Norman Shaw; and he worked in the office of that great arts and craftsman, James Marjoribanks Maclaren, another architect from the Salmon and Sellars stables, who built the brilliant new wing at the Old High School of Stirling (1887), Aberfeldy Town Hall (1889), the farmhouse at Glenlyon and the hotel and half-Dorset half-Scottish thatched cottages at Fortingall (1889–91), the Glenlyon and Aberfeldy buildings showing an awareness of the work of the American architect H H Richardson. Through this select London circle he became aware of, and acquired contacts with the likes of Philip Webb (who had built an important Arts & Crafts house at Arisaig in 1863), C R Ashbee and W R Lethaby. All of this was strongly reflected in Lorimer's architecture after he returned to Edinburgh. His early harled houses, the cottages at Colinton and larger houses such as the Grange, North Berwick (1893), were developments from Maclaren's Glenlyon buildings. Brackenburgh Cumberland (1901), and Bunkershill, North Berwick (1904), showed his careful study of such Shaw houses as Dawpool and Adcote. It was, however, in his own peculiarly refined Arts & Crafts Scots baronial houses at Rowallan (1902), Ardkinglas (1906) and, finally, the brilliantly deceptive fantasy of Formakin (1908), all with a carefully studied use of materials developed from his early restoration of Earlshall (1892), that Lorimer particularly excelled. Apart from W R Lethaby's Melsetter (1898) his work was matched only by that of John Kinross and Lorimer's friend Francis Deas. Kinross was much more self-taught, apparently never having been in a really good office. The Peel (1904) and the houses in Edinburgh's Mortonhall Road, where he lived himself (1899), challenged comparison with the very best that Lorimer could do. Deas, another pupil of Anderson, excelled at Braehead, St Boswells (1905), and Fyndynate (1909). None of the other architects of the time had the same mastery of materials even although Browne and Peddie showed an equal mastery of design, notably at Browne's Johnsburn, Balerno (c 1900), and Peddie's Jacobean Westerdunes, North Berwick (1909), which challenges comparison with Lorimer's Bunkershill nearby. In his later years Sydney Mitchell came to work in an Arts & Crafts style worthy of comparison with Lorimer's, notably at his own house The Pleasaunce, Gullane (1902).

Another architect who was early into Arts & Crafts architecture was the much less well-known W L Carruthers of Inverness who had been lucky enough to find a place in the office of Sir Ernest George, an architect very nearly as able as Shaw with a skill in the use of materials which matched that of Devey. His own house Lethington (1892) was an early masterpiece of the genre as were his smaller but still better 22–26 Crown Drive (1895), both in Inverness. His later work never quite matched his early promise.

No architect practising in the west of Scotland found his way to offices quite as good as those, and the style of Shaw and his friends had to be learned more from published sources and visits to the south. The first important followers of Shaw's domestic architecture were established figures such as Sellars whose Keil (c 1880) reflected Cragside, T L Watson whose Red Hall, later Homelands on Glasgow's Great Western Road (1885) drew motifs from several of his half-timbered houses, and Leiper whose Clarendon, Helensburgh (1891), recalled Adcote.

As a domestic architect Leiper was much the most important of these. His François Ier Cairndhu, Helensburgh (1871), anticipated Browne's use of the style by a decade and a half. Like his baronial Colearn, Auchterarder (1869), and his larger and brilliantly managed

Kinlochmoidart (1884) it had aesthetic movement interior work with stained glass by Daniel Cottier, and superb Anglo-Japanese tilework by W B Simpson & Sons. Leiper's later work in the same vein such as the Red Tower, Helensburgh (1898), had rather more orthodox neo-Jacobean interiors. Most of his later houses are stylish Arts & Crafts with half-timber and strong roof shapes and chimneys which may owe something to American publications of the time as at Endrick Lodge, Stirling (1900), Morar Lodge, Helensburgh (1902), and Uplands, Bridge of Allan (1907).

Contemporary American domestic design had made occasional appearances in Scotland from the 1880s onwards. William Kidner, who had worked in Shanghai and perhaps also in the United States, designed two rather surprising American brownstone mansions near Elgin, the long and low Lesmurdie (1881) and the towered Haugh (1882). These remained isolated examples of the genre. Much more significant were American half-timbered houses designed by John Murray Robertson, a former assistant of Heiton's, at Dundee, notably The Cottage, Lochee (1880) and The Bughties, Broughty Ferry (1884), both of which showed markedly the influence of H H Richardson in the details.

American influence was also marked at times in the work of the architects who had studied at the Ecole des Beaux Arts, particularly that of John James Burnet. His Corrienessan, Loch Ard (1886), although half-timbered, was an American shingle-style verandah house on plan as well as on elevation, and had he won the competition his Clyde Yacht Club at Hunter's Quay would have been a much larger essay in the same vein: an orthodox Norman Shaw school design by T L Watson was preferred. In a different vein his reconstruction of Edinbarnet in 1889 sported an American Romanesque porch.

Burnet's major domestic work was, however, in his own particular brand of 'Scots Renaissance', a 17th-century baroque worked up in matching in a splendid billiard room and porte-cochère to Burn's neo-Jacobean Auchterarder House in 1886. Thereafter it re-appeared in the large baronial Baronald (1890), a house full of original ideas, and in several public buildings notably the Public Baths at Alloa (1895) and his partner John A Campbell's Ewing Gilmour Institute at Alexandria (1888). Garmoyle, Dumbarton (1890), was a smaller, simpler Baronald with Arts & Crafts raked-joint masonry, and, like the Ewing Gilmour Institute, had its roof swept low down, American shingle-style fashion, at the back. Burnet's final major country house was Fairnalie (1904) a suaver and bolder harled version of Baronald with a superb formal garden. Alexander Nisbet Paterson, an ex-assistant of Burnet's who followed him to the Beaux Arts, designed some fine houses in a quieter version of the same vein, notably his own The Croft, Helensburgh. Another ex-assistant of Burnet's who attended the Beaux Arts was Stewart Henbest Capper whose continental travels were reflected in the brilliantly picturesque fantasy of Edinburgh's Ramsay Garden (1892) designed under the inspiration of Patrick Geddes, and continued after Capper's departure by Sydney Mitchell who succeeded no less brilliantly in the same vein. Yet another architect associated with Burnet's office was H E Clifford who built many Arts & Crafts houses which were much admired by Hermann Muthesius, most notably Stoneleigh, Kelvinside (1901), and Shennanton (c 1908).

Burnet also had a considerable influence on later 19th-century church design. It was a period of great liturgically-designed memorial churches. The design of Burnet's Barony Church was in varying degrees reflected in several, perhaps most notably T G Abercrombie's Clark Memorial Church, Largs (1892), with which he was assisted by Burnet's ex-assistant William Kerr. In the big roofed low-walled churches with sturdy towers and mixed late Gothic and Romanesque motifs Burnet designed at St Molio's, Shiskine (1886), Dundas, Grangemouth

(1894), the Gardner Memorial at Brechin (1896) and the MacLaren Memorial at Stenhousemuir (1897), Burnet introduced a markedly Scottish character contrasted with English Tudor half-timbered porches. Correspondence at Grangemouth reveals that Burnet favoured the type because they were inexpensive to construct leaving funds available for high quality detail. Other Glasgow architects, notably W G Rowan and H E Clifford, followed his lead at St Margaret's, Tollcross, and St Michael's, Carntyne, respectively (both 1902). The type soon spread elsewhere, a particularly good example being Thoms & Wilkie's Free Church at Edzell (1900).

The revival of the more characteristic late Scots gothic forms came surprisingly late, despite the excellent illustrations provided by Billings. Only Bryce had adopted it with his experience of Edinburgh's Trinity College Church in mind and not very successfully. Surprisingly the first major late Scots gothic building, the crown-towered St Leonard's-in-the-Fields at Perth (1885) was designed from London by J J Stevenson, who later designed the Stevenson Memorial, Glasgow (1898), and the Peter Memorial Church, Stirling (1901), in the same vein. Thereafter the late Scots gothic manner was taken up enthusiastically by a number of architects, most notably by Sydney Mitchell at his reconstruction of the Parish Church at Chirnside (1906), Lorimer's pupil Ramsay Traquair at the Christian Science Church, Inverleith, Edinburgh (1910); and Reginald Fairlie at Our Lady & St Meddan's, Troon (1911), all with oblong towers; and, most ambitiously of all, by the Aberdeen architect Alexander Marshall Mackenzie at the cathedral-like Lowson Memorial Church, Forfar (1912), with its central St Monans spire and Duffus-like manse. Although the overall effect was perhaps English rather than Scottish, late Scots gothic detail is also evident in two outstandingly fine episcopal churches by the London-based architect John Ninian Comper, who had Aberdonian origins at St Margaret's, Braemar (1898), and St Mary's, Kirriemuir (1904).

Scottish also in origin were the Romanesque churches of Peter MacGregor Chalmers, a pupil of John Honeyman, though not all of them received the St Rule and Brechin towers intended for them. Complete examples can be seen at St Ninian's, Prestwick (1908), St Leonard's, Dunfermline (c 1900), and Kirm (1906). Some of his later churches show marked continental influence, Italian at St Anne's, Corstorphine, and German at St Margaret's, Newlands (1912).

Sydney Mitchell's cathedral-like Crichton Memorial Church at Crichton Royal Hospital, Dumfries (1890), the greatest ecclesiastical commission of the era, was unaffected by the new sense of Scottish identity in church design, as indeed were most of his churches which tended to follow Rowan Anderson's late gothic models, most notably at Belford Church (1888) and Candlish Church (1900), Edinburgh. As with his domestic work some are strong in concept but indifferent in execution reflecting his over-large practice. Some of his late churches, Port Ellen (1898) and the remarkable Chalmers Memorial, Cockenzie (1904), reflect Scandinavian influence.

The last years of the century were of great complexity. In Glasgow German early Renaissance made an appearance in Baird and Thomson's tall commercial blocks notably the Liverpool, London & Globe Building (1899) on St Vincent Street and Connals' on West George Street (1898), echoes in some degree of William Hamilton Beattie's Jenners store, Edinburgh (1893) where the individual details were as much Oxford early Renaissance as German. Charles Rennie Mackintosh's designs for the Art Gallery at Kelvingrove, alas unsuccessful, mixed a wide variety of motifs drawn from his tour of Italy and combined them with more modern elements, while his Queen's Cross Church, Glasgow (1897), is one of the best examples of the increasing freedom to be seen in late gothic church design towards the end of the century, another being Salmon, Son & Gillespie's Lloyd Morris Memorial Church,

Glasgow (1902). They were also responsible for Rowantreehill, Kilmacolm (1898), Forrest Salmon's own house, which is one of the more spectacular Scottish examples of English half-timber. Their other houses, together with Mackintosh's own Windyhill (1900), Kilmacolm and The Hill House, Helensburgh (1902), have English and Scottish vernacular origins but form a separate subject. Much more consciously historical was Gillespie's free Scots Renaissance Municipal Buildings (1907), tragically unfinished, which was designed to evoke the regal splendour of Stirling in early Renaissance times. Although much good work was done after the First World War, including Lorimer's Scottish National War Memorial at Edinburgh Castle, it marked the end of an era.