

PROCEEDINGS
of the
Society of Antiquaries
of Scotland



Volume 154
(2025)

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland
National Museums Scotland
Chambers Street, Edinburgh EH1 1JF

This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Copyright © 2025 the authors, contributors and the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland. It is permitted to produce and share:

- i. Single copies of papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for private use of an individual;
- ii. Single copies of papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use;
- iii. Multiple copies of papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for educational purpose within a non-profit-making institution.

The above permission does not extend to producing copies for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, creation of new collective works or resale.

Requests for permission to reproduce material where the Society holds copyright should be made via www.socantscot.org/publications/copyright-permissions

The online version of the following articles are available in open access under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License. <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

‘Revisiting Knap of Howar, Papa Westray, Orkney’ by Hazel Moore FSAScot and Graeme Wilson FSAScot

‘Ultima Thule? Reconnecting St Kilda and Pabbay’ by George F Geddes FSAScot

‘This flag was never a French one’: Abbotsford, authenticity and the Battle of Waterloo’ by Kirsty Archer-Thompson FSAScot and Stuart Allan FSAScot

‘Scottish archaeological islands: a historiographical analysis and the legacy of antiquarian research’ by Stephanie Blankshein et al.

‘Peripheral vision: Operation Rotor, radar infrastructure and state power in Scotland 1950–1957’ by Jim Gledhill FSAScot

Important: Images in this publication are not covered by the Creative Commons licence. Copyright information for images is provided separately in captions. Permissions must be obtained from copyright holders to reuse images.

ISSN 0081-1564 (print) | 2056-743X (online)

For further information, please go to the journal website at: <https://journals.socantscot.org/index.php/psas>. For information relating to GPSR compliance, please see our website: <https://www.socantscot.org/gpsr-compliance/>

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is a registered Scottish charity no. SC010440

Typeset in Times New Roman by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth

Manufactured in Great Britain by Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow

Published December 2025

Table of Contents

v	DIRECTOR'S NOTE
vii	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
ix	EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD
xi	COUNCIL
xiii	PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS
xv	LAWS THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND

OBITUARIES

- 1 Gordon Stirling Maxwell MA FSA FRSE FSAScot
William S Hanson FSAScot
- 9 Professor Andrew Colin Renfrew, Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn MA (Cantab) PhD ScD
Hon DLitt FSA HonFSAScot HonFRSE FBA Hon AIA
Alison Sheridan FSAScot and Trevor Watkins FSAScot

ARTICLES AND REPORTS

- 15 Revisiting Knap of Howar, Papa Westray, Orkney
Hazel Moore FSAScot and Graeme Wilson FSAScot, with contributions from Seren Griffiths
This paper was awarded the R B K Stevenson Award
- 35 Burnt bones from Dùn Bhoraraic, Isle of Islay: untangling Hebridean 'U' structures, Viking graves and Iron Age mortuary theatre
Alan Macniven FSAScot, David H Caldwell FSAScot and Cecilia Medina-Petersson FSAScot
- 59 The Traprain Law jug with biblical scenes
Linda Safran
- 83 The Dyce inscription and the morphosyntax of Pictish
Bernard Mees
- 99 Watching the waters: sentinel sites in the Inner Hebrides and western seaboard of Scotland
Shane McLeod FSAScot
This paper was awarded the Murray Prize for History

- 117 Bannockburn – where the ‘blades and harness rang’: Uncovering conflict-related artefacts from Scotland’s iconic medieval battlefield
Warren Bailie FSAScot and Natasha Ferguson FSAScot
- 137 The Savernake horn – a relic of Thomas Randolph, 1st Earl of Moray?
David H Caldwell FSAScot
- 149 Ultima Thule? Reconnecting St Kilda and Pabbay
George F Geddes FSAScot
- 173 The abduction of Lady Grange to St Kilda: searching for truth
Tony Dalton FSAScot
- 193 Tokens of Jacobitism
Georgia Vullingsh
- 205 ‘This flag was never a French one’: Abbotsford, authenticity and the Battle of Waterloo
Kirsty Archer-Thompson FSAScot and Stuart Allan FSAScot
- 223 ‘This awful and distressing circumstance’: translating Ibn Faḍlān’s ‘Vikings’ for *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*
Tonicha M Upham
- 239 Displaying antiquities in the museum of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland 1849 to 1870
Julie Holder FSAScot
- 259 The archaeology of whin mills in post-medieval north-east Scotland
Tracy J Brook, Michael J Stratigos FSAScot and Jeff Oliver FSAScot
- 287 Scottish archaeological islands: a historiographical analysis and the legacy of antiquarian research
Stephanie Blankshein, Angela Gannon, Duncan Garrow and Fraser Sturt
- 309 Peripheral vision: Operation Rotor, radar infrastructure and state power in Scotland 1950–1957
Jim Gledhill FSAScot
- 329 Index

Director's Note

This volume of the *Proceedings* was produced during a year which saw the key national online dataset for the historic environment hosted by Historic Environment Scotland, Canmore, replaced by a new service called Trove.scot. For the *Proceedings* this means a change is required in how we reference data in that record but for this volume we have retained Canmore IDs and will make any required changes in the next edition.

This volume also sees the posthumous publication of a paper by Kirsty Archer-Thompson FSAScot. Kirsty was a staunch supporter of the Society, and we had the pleasure of working with her in many different capacities over her all too short period as the knowledgeable, lively and fun Curator and Interpretation Manager at Abbotsford. We have released her paper with Dr Stuart Allan FSAScot on three artefacts from Sir Walter Scott's collection free to access online in her memory and record here our sympathies to her friends and family.

The Anniversary Meeting of the Society on 30 November 2024 saw the election of 73 Fellows, the re-election of four Council members – Professor Donna Heddle, and Doctors Kenneth Aitchison (as Treasurer), Heather Pulliam and Alison Sheridan – and a 5% increase in subscription rates. Fellows also voted for a change to Law 3 of the Society which means nominees for Fellowship now require a single supporting Fellow. The event also saw the presentation of the inaugural Audrey Henshall Legacy Award of £50,000 to Archaeology Scotland to support their project *Scotland's Earliest Megalithic Monuments*. This celebrates the achievements of Audrey Shore Henshall who was an Honorary Fellow of the Society and doyen of Neolithic studies, especially her work on the burial monuments of the period. Audrey sadly passed away in December 2021, and a full obituary by Jack Stevenson was published in the *Proceedings* in 2022. On her death Audrey left the Society £100,000 in her will, a one-sixth share of the residue of her estate, to 'be used for research or field work on pre-Roman antiquities in Scotland and not for general excavation work, and that the said Society will publish the results of such research or field work.' Council have decided to use the remainder of this gratefully received legacy to support other relevant projects as and when the income from the invested funds provides an adequate amount.

The £100 RBK Stevenson Award for 2024 was presented to Professor Jane Geddes FSAScot for her paper 'Reconsidering the Forres cross-slab (Sueno's Stone), part 2: iconography' and the £500 Chalmers Jervise Prize was presented to Professor Karen Hardy FSAScot and Dr Torben Ballin FSAScot for their paper titled 'South Cuidrach: a new Late Upper Palaeolithic and Mesolithic site on the Isle of Skye, western Scotland'. Finally, I shall take this opportunity to say thank you to Kate Bailey who has ably taken up the post of Editorial Manager in the Society and successfully brought this volume, her first from start to finish, to publication. She has latterly been supported by Lynne Reilly who started with us in January 2025 as Publications Officer.

SIMON GILMOUR MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

List of abbreviations commonly used in the *Proceedings*

ADS	Archaeology Data Service
AIA	Association for Industrial Archaeology
ALGAO	Association of Local Government Archaeological Officers
BAR	British Archaeological Reports
CBA	Council for British Archaeology
CifA	Chartered Institute for Archaeologists
CSA	Council for Scottish Archaeology (now Archaeology Scotland)
DES	Discovery and Excavation in Scotland
DSR	Data Structure Report
HERs	Historic Environment Records
HES	Historic Environment Scotland
HMSO	His Majesty's Stationery Office
NMS	National Museums Scotland
OS	Ordnance Survey
OSA	Old Statistical Account 1791–99
RCAHMS	Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
SAIR	Scottish Archaeological Internet Reports
ScARF	Scottish Archaeological Research Framework
SMR	Sites and monuments record

Editorial Advisory Board for the *Proceedings* vol 154

LINDSEY BÜSTER, BSc(HONS) MA PhD FSAScot PCIfA
 DAVID H CALDWELL, MA PhD FSA FSAScot
 PROFESSOR MIKE CHURCH, BSc(HONS) PhD FSAScot
 PROFESSOR JOHN COLLIS, BA MA PhD FSA FSAScot MCIfA
 BRYONY COOMBS PhD FSAScot
 PROFESSOR VICKI CUMMINGS, PhD FSA FSAScot MCIfA
 PROFESSOR JANE DOWNES, BA(HONS) PhD FSAScot MCIfA
 PROFESSOR STEPHEN DRISCOLL, BA MSc PhD FRSE FSA FSAScot
 PROFESSOR EMERITUS WILLIAM GILLIES, MA DLitt FRSE FRHistS FSAScot
 ANNA GROUNDWATER, PhD FRHistS FSAScot
 STRATFORD HALLIDAY, BSc FSAScot
 PROFESSOR DEREK HAMILTON, BA MA PhD FSA FSAScot
 MAYA HOOLE, FSAScot
 FRASER HUNTER, BSc PhD FSA FSAScot
 HEATHER JAMES, BA MSc PhD FSAScot MCIfA
 PROFESSOR RICHARD ORAM, MA PhD FSA FRSA FSAScot
 CATRIONA PICKARD, BSc MA PhD FSAScot
 LI SOU, BA (Hons) MA PhD FSAScot PCIfA
 RONAN TOOLIS, MA(HONS) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

Director

SIMON GILMOUR, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

Editorial Manager

KATE BAILEY, FSAScot

Publications Officer

LYNNE REILLY, FSAScot

Copy-editor

SUSAN MILLIGAN

Indexer

NICOLA KING

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council from 30 November 2024

President

DIANA MURRAY, CBE MA(CANTAB) FSA HonFSAScot FRSE FRSGS MCIfA MIOd (elected 2023)

Vice Presidents (appointed for three years with initial year of election in brackets)

SAM MILLS, MSc FSAScot (2020, appointed Vice President 30 November 2024)

SUZANNE LYLE, PhD FSAScot FRSA (2021, appointed Vice President 30 November 2022)

Treasurer (elected each year; first year of election in brackets)

KENNETH AITCHISON, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA (2020, re-elected 2024)

Members of Council (elected for three years with year of election in brackets)

MANDA FORSTER, PhD FSAScot MCIfA (2020, re-elected 2023)

PROFESSOR HEATHER PULLIAM, PhD FSAScot (2021, re-elected 2024)

ALISON SHERIDAN, FBA FRSE FSA FSAScot CorrMDAI ACIfA (2021, re-elected 2024)

PROFESSOR DONNA HEDDLE, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot FHEA FRSA (2021, re-elected 2024)

PROFESSOR IAN BAXTER, MA(Hons) PhD(Cantab) FSA FSAScot FRSA PCIfA (2022)

EMMA CARVER, MPhil FSA FSAScot (2022)

JO THOMAS MCKENZIE, BA MA PhD FSAScot MCIfA (2023)

ELLEN McADAM, MA DPhil MCIfA FSAScot (2023)

Co-opted Members of Council

ALEX FITZPATRICK, BA PhD FSAScot (co-opted 2025)

ROSS LAIRD, MA DipCAM FSAScot (co-opted 2025)

Ex Officio Members of Council

MARTIN GOLDBERG, PhD FSAScot (appointed 2022, representative of the National Museums Scotland)

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

Patron

HIS MAJESTY THE KING CHARLES III, HonFSAScot

Honorary Fellows (HonFSAScot)

ROBERT G W ANDERSON, MA DPhil FRSE FSA HonFSAScot

C NEAL ASCHERSON, HonFSAScot

COLLEEN BATEY, PhD HonFSAScot MBE BSc Dip Arch HonFSAScot

EMERITUS PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA FSA Fil Dr hc FBA MCIfA HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD HonDLitt FRSE FSA HonFSAScot HonMCIfA

PROFESSOR MARTIN CARVER, FBA FSA HonFSAScot

BARBARA CRAWFORD, OBE MA PhD FSA FRSE HonFSAScot

GORDON EWART, BA DipEd HonFSAScot

ISABEL HENDERSON, OBE MA (Abdn) MA PhD (Camb) HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR JOHN HUME, OBE BSc ARCST HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR DR LEENDERT LOUWE KOOIJMANS, HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN, HonFSA HonMEAA HonFSAScot

EMERITUS PROFESSOR J V S MEGAW, AM CM MA DLitt FAHA FSA HonFSAScot MCIfA KMDAI

DIANA MURRAY, CBE MA FRSE FRSGS FSA HonFSAScot MCIfA MIoD

ANNA RITCHIE, OBE BA PhD FSA HonFSAScot

JANE RYDER, OBE MA WS FRSE FSA HonFSAScot

LISBETH THOMS, MBE BSc Dip.Archaeol HonFSAScot

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland was founded 18 December 1780 and instituted by a Royal Charter on 29 March 1783, with a Supplementary Charter awarded on 22 April 2019

It is a registered Scottish Charity No. SC010440

LAWS OF THE SOCIETY FROM 30 NOVEMBER 2024

1. The purpose of this Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
2. The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
3. Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by one Fellow. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not able to obtain a sponsor Fellow, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances and credentials of the candidate concerned, to waive the necessity for a sponsor from among the Fellowship.
4. Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. The method of voting will be prescribed by the Council.
5. Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed twenty-five.
6. Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, they shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 7.
7. Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on a date in each year specified by Council; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the defaulter may be removed from the Fellowship. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to re-join the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription – in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available – or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.

8. Fellows, including Honorary Fellows and Council members, whose actions or behaviour might in the opinion of Council bring the Society into disrepute may be removed from the Fellowship. Council will consider the removal and advise the Fellow of its decision. Any Fellow so considered will be given the opportunity to appeal the decision to a panel independent of Council consisting of Fellows and at least one non-Fellow. The determination of this panel will be final.
9. Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed or electronic form Proceedings of the Society from the date of election.
10. None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
11. Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Eight members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes at least two Office-bearers and six elected members of Council.
12. The Council shall consist of at least eleven Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North East Section *ex officio*, the Society representative of the National Museums Scotland (NMS) *ex officio* who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the NMS Board of Trustees) and up to two co-opted persons appointed by the Council to fill a vacancy on the Council. The total number of members of the Council shall not exceed fifteen at any time.
13. The Office-bearers of the Council shall consist of a President, two Vice-Presidents and a Treasurer.
14. The President shall be elected for a period of up to three years and may stand for election as President for a second term, subject to Law 16 below. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and, subject to Law 16 below, shall be eligible for re-election provided however that the term of office of the President and the Treasurer respectively may not exceed six years in total. The elections of the President and the Treasurer shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.
15. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed by the Council from amongst the elected members of the Council. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed for an initial term of up to three years and may be appointed for a further term of up to three years, subject to Law 16 below.
16. Elected members of the Council shall hold office as Council members for an initial term of up to three years. A retiring Member of the Council who has held office for one term shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council and, if so re-elected, shall hold office for a further term of up to three years. The election shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meeting upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least 14 days before the meeting.
17. A retiring member of the Council who has held office for two terms shall not be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council unless such re-election is as an Office-bearer of the Council, provided however that no person shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council in any circumstances if such re-election would result in that person's period of membership of the Council in any capacity exceeding nine years unless a period of at least two years has elapsed since the date of that person's previous retirement from the Council.

18. A co-opted member of the Council shall be eligible for election as a member of the Council in accordance with Law 15 at the next Annual General Meeting following their appointment as a co-opted member of the Council and shall vacate office at the conclusion of that Annual General Meeting if they are not elected as a member of the Council. Immediately following each Annual General Meeting, the Council may re-appoint under Law 11 any individual who, as a co-opted member of the Council, vacated office under this Law at the conclusion of an Annual General Meeting; the Council may alternatively appoint someone in their place or resolve not to fill the vacancy.
19. Vacancies among the elected members of Council, the President and the Treasurer occurring by completion of term of office, by resignation, death or otherwise shall be filled by election at the Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council.
20. The Council may appoint committees or individuals to advise on the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.
21. The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30th November, or on the preceding or the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.
22. The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
23. Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 20, shall be held in each year.
24. Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.