# PROCEEDINGS of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland



Volume 152 (2023)

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland National Museums Scotland Chambers Street, Edinburgh EH1 1JF This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Copyright © 2023 the authors, contributors and the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland. It is permitted to produce and share:

- i. Single copies of papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for private use of an individual;
- ii. Single copies of papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use:
- iii. Multiple copies of papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for educational purpose within a non-profit-making institution.

The above permission does not extend to producing copies for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, creation of new collective works or resale.

Requests for permission to reproduce material where the Society holds copyright should be made via https://www.socantscot.org/publications/copyrightpermissions

The online versions of the following articles are available in open access under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY 4.0) licence https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0

'Excavation and survey at the Giant's Grave, Slochd Measach, Nereabolls, a Neolithic chambered cairn on the Isle of Islay, Argyll & Bute: chronology, architecture, reuse and demise' by Darko Maričević FSAScot and Steven Mithen FSAScot

'The origin of the Portuguese Drummonds: a Scotsman in late medieval Madeira?' by Jonathan J F Sykes

Important: Images in this publication are not covered by the Creative Commons licence. Copyright information for images is provided separately in captions. Permissions must be obtained from copyright holders to reuse images.

ISSN 0081-1564 (print) | 2056-743X (online)

For further information, please go to the journal website at: http://journals.socantscot.org/index.php/psas

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is a registered Scottish charity no. SC010440

Typeset in Times New Roman by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth

Manufactured in Great Britain by Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow

Published December 2023

#### Table of Contents

- v DIRECTOR'S NOTE
- vii LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
- ix EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD
- xi COUNCIL
- xiii PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS
- XV LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND

#### **OBITUARY**

1 Professor Johannes Diderik van der Waals HonFSAScot Harry Fokkens

#### ARTICLES AND REPORTS

9 Excavation and survey at the Giant's Grave, Slochd Measach, Nereabolls, a Neolithic chambered cairn on the Isle of Islay, Argyll & Bute: chronology, architecture, reuse and demise

#### Darko Maričević FSAScot and Steven Mithen FSAScot

Small socketed axeheads from northern Britain: some finds 'of more than ordinary interest'
Ella B Paul FSAScot, Matthew G Knight FSAScot and Trevor G Cowie FSAScot

This paper was awarded the R B K Stevenson Award

83 The production of a glass toggle: Iron Age craft specialisation along Scotland's western seaboard

#### Martina Bertini, Clare Ellis FSAScot and Dan Sykes

111 A drive around Pictland: wheeled transport on Pictish carved stones

Catriona McArdle and Duncan McArdle FSAScot

Asking for forgiveness as an aspect of crusade: case studies from 13th-century Scotland **Gordon M Reynolds** 

This paper was awarded the Murray Prize for History

'Remember the days of old, consider the years of many generations': chapel-sites in the Isle of Lewis

Rachel C Barrowman FSAScot

193 Strome, the castle of Loch Carron: role and history

#### **James Scott Petre FSAScot**

The Cummings of Altyre and the search for an ancient genealogy, part 2: 'Truth has here lain in the bottom of a well'

#### John Cleary FSAScot

241 The origin of the Portuguese Drummonds: a Scotsman in late medieval Madeira?

#### Jonathan J F Sykes

William Bruce's Hopetoun House and the arrival of Serlio's unpublished 'Sixth Book on Dwellings' in Britain, *c* 1700

#### Ian Campbell FSAScot

A comparison of ligatures on gravestones in Scotland, Northern Germany and the French Basque region

#### **George Thomson FSAScot**

305 The Preacher Stone in the Bathgate Hills

#### **Alastair Small FSAScot and Carola Small FSAScot**

321 Survey and excavations investigating shieling and other upland practices in Gleann Leac-na-Muidhe, Glencoe

#### **Edward Stewart FSAScot**

The origins and development of a Scottish surgical instrument maker: the family firm of Archibald Young from 1771 until 1886

#### **Ruth Pollitt**

365 A curious account of ancient Egyptian Treasure Trove in Scotland

#### Elizabeth Goring and Margaret Maitland FSAScot

387 Index

#### Director's note

At the 2022 Anniversary Meeting of the Society, Fellows voted to agree new increased subscription rates for membership. From the 1 July 2023 these now include a reduction for those Fellows eligible to receive a hardcopy version of the *Proceedings* who opt to instead receive the digital version only. This follows substantial increases in hardcopy publishing costs including everything from paper to postage. We do not see any prospect of these costs reducing significantly in future, and indeed they may continue to increase.

To help manage the costs of the hardcopy *Proceedings*, Council has agreed to cap the size of the volumes to around 350 pages. This will mean that budgets can be more accurately predicted annually and will end larger, and more costly to print and post, volumes. However, we still expect to publish the wide range of articles covering all aspects of antiquarian endeavour examining Scotland's past written by authors with a variety of backgrounds.

To help maintain this size of volume, editorial processes will necessarily become stricter and we emphasise that articles for the *Proceedings* should be a maximum of 10,000 words long (including references) with 12 images. We also remind authors to check the submission guidelines available from the *Proceedings* webpages (http://journals.socantscot.org/index.php/psas/index) and ensure their paper conforms to these and our style guide prior to submission. Longer papers might be more suited to our open access and fully peer-reviewed SAIR journal (http://journals.socantscot.org/index.php/sair). As always, if you have any questions regarding publishing with the Society, please do not hesitate to contact the Managing Editor, Adela Rauchova, at editor@socantscot.org or write to the office.

Our voluntary Editorial Advisory Board (EAB) continues to develop as we look to broaden the expertise available and ensure that it is as inclusive as possible. We welcome to the Board Dr Bryony Coombs, currently Teaching Fellow in Renaissance Art History at the Edinburgh College of Art; Dr Li Sou, Senior Illustrator at Cotswold Archaeology; and Maya Hoole, currently at Historic Environment Scotland. Dr Coombs' research interests include the transfer of ideas in northern Europe and text and image relationships in late-medieval manuscripts, and she published in the *Proceedings* in 2019. <sup>1</sup> Dr Sou's work on Mousa broch led her to develop an interactive iBook on Iron Age Shetland and Maya's publication of a 4,200-year-old Early Bronze Age Beaker burial from the Scottish Highlands in 2018 is one of the most viewed papers in the *Proceedings*. <sup>2</sup> We continue to look for more members for the EAB and if you are interested, please do not hesitate to contact the Managing Editor.

This volume of the *Proceedings* ranges over topics as diverse as a Neolithic Chambered tomb on Islay to Scots in Madeira and Egyptian Treasure Trove in Scotland. We hope you enjoy it as much as we did putting it together.

SIMON GILMOUR, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Coombs, B 2019 'John Stuart, Duke of Albany and his contribution to military science in Scotland and Italy, 1514–36', *Proc Soc Antig Scot* 148: 231–66. https://doi.org/10.9750/PSAS.148.1265

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Hoole, M, Sheridan, A, Boyle, A, Booth, T, Brace, S, Diekmann, Y, Olalde, I, Thomas, M, Barnes, I, Evans, J, Chenery, C, Sloane, H, Morrison, H, Fraser, S, Timpany, S & Hamilton, D 2018 "Ava": a Beaker-associated woman from a cist at Achavanich, Highland, and the story of her (re-)discovery and subsequent study', *Proc Soc Antiq Scot* 147: 73–118. https://doi.org/10.9750/PSAS.147.1250

#### List of abbreviations commonly used in the *Proceedings*

ADS	Archaeology Data Service
AIA	Association for Industrial Archaeology
ALGAO	Association of Local Government Archaeological Officers
BAR	British Archaeological Reports
CBA	Council for British Archaeology
CIfA	Chartered Institute for Archaeologists
CSA	Council for Scottish Archaeology (now Archaeology Scotland)
DES	Discovery and Excavation in Scotland
DSR	Data Structure Report
HERs	Historic Environment Records
HES	Historic Environment Scotland
HMSO	His Majesty's Stationery Office
NMS	National Museums Scotland
OS	Ordnance Survey
OSA	Old Statistical Account 1791–99
RCAHMS	Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
SAIR	Scottish Archaeological Internet Reports
ScARF	Scottish Archaeological Research Framework
SMR	Sites and monuments record

#### Editorial Advisory Board for the *Proceedings* vol 152

PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD HonDLitt FRSE FSA HonFSAScot HonMCIfA

LINDSEY BÜSTER, BSc(Hons) MA PhD FSAScot PCIfA

DAVID H CALDWELL, MA PhD FSA FSAScot

PROFESSOR MIKE CHURCH, BSc(Hons) PhD FSAScot

PROFESSOR JOHN COLLIS, BA MA PhD FSA FSAScot MCIfA

BRYONY COOMBS, PhD FSAScot

PROFESSOR VICKI CUMMINGS, PhD FSA FSAScot MCIfA

PROFESSOR JANE DOWNES, BA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

PROFESSOR STEPHEN DRISCOLL, BAMSc PhD FRSE FSA FSAScot

PROFESSOR EMERITUS WILLIAM GILLIES, MA DLitt FRSE FRHIstS FSAScot

ANNA GROUNDWATER, PhD FRHistS FSAScot

STRATFORD HALLIDAY, BSc FSAScot

PROFESSOR DEREK HAMILTON, BA MA PhD FSA FSAScot

PROFESSOR DENNIS HARDING, MA DPhil FRSE FSAScot

MAYA HOOLE, FSAScot

FRASER HUNTER, BSc PhD FSA FSAScot

HEATHER JAMES, BA MSc PhD FSAScot MCIfA

PROFESSOR RICHARD ORAM, MA PhD FSA FRSA FSAScot

CATRIONA PICKARD, BSc MA PhD FSAScot

LI SOU, BA(Hons) MA PhD FSAScot PCIfA

RONAN TOOLIS, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

#### Director

SIMON GILMOUR, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA

Managing Editors

ADELA RAUCHOVA

KATE BAILEY

Publications Officers

KATE BAILEY

BEATRIZ ROSSO AVILA

Copy-editor

Susan Milligan

Indexer

NICOLA KING

### Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council from 30 November 2021

#### President

ABERCROMBY EMERITUS PROFESSOR IAN B McL RALSTON, OBE MA PhD DLitt FRSE FSA FSAScot MCIfA (elected 2020)

#### Vice Presidents

HEATHER JAMES, BA MSc PhD FSAScot MCIfA (2016, appointed Vice President 18 March 2019, re-elected 2019, completed term of office 2022)

Deborah Lamb, MA(Cantab) PhD FSAScot (2018, appointed Vice President 30 November 2021) SUZANNE LYLE, PhD FSAScot FRSA (2021, appointed Vice President 30 November 2022)

Treasurer (elected each year, first year of election in brackets)

KENNETH AITCHISON, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot MCIfA (2020)

*Members of Council (elected for three years with year of election in brackets)* 

Professor Hector MacQueen, CBE LLB(Hons) PhD FBA FRSE FSAScot (2017, re-elected 2020)

IAIN McDowall, BA MA(Hons) FSAScot MRICS (2017, re-elected 2020)

SAM MILLS, MSc FSAScot (2020)

MANDA FORSTER, PhD FSAScot MCIfA (2020)

HEATHER PULLIAM, PhD FSAScot (2021)

PROFESSOR IAIN R TORRANCE, KCVO Kt TD DPhil FRSE FSAScot (2021)

ALISON SHERIDAN, FBA FRSE FSA FSAScot CorrMDAI ACIfA (2021)

PROFESSOR DONNA HEDDLE, MA(Hons) PhD FSAScot FHEA FRSA (2021)

Professor Ian Baxter, MA(Hons) PhD(Cantab) FSA FSAScot FRSA PCIfA (2022)

EMMA CARVER, MPhil FSA FSAScot (2022)

Co-opted Members of Council

None at present

Ex Officio Members of Council

MARTIN GOLDBERG, FSAScot (2022, representative of the National Museums Scotland)

## Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

#### Patron

HIS MAJESTY THE KING CHARLES III, HONFSAScot

Honorary Fellows (HonFSAScot)

ROBERT G W ANDERSON, MA DPhil FRSE FSA HonFSAScot

C NEAL ASCHERSON, HonFSAScot

EMERITUS PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA FSA Fil Dr hc FBA MCIfA HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD HonDLitt FRSE FSA HonFSAScot HonMCIfA

PROFESSOR MARTIN CARVER, FBA FSA HonFSAScot

EMERITUS PROFESSOR RICHARD FAWCETT, OBE PhD FRSE FSA HonFSAScot

ISABEL HENDERSON, OBE MA (Abdn) MA PhD (Camb) HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR DR LEENDERT LOUWE KOOIJMANS, HONFSAScot

PROFESSOR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN, HONFSA HONMEAA HONFSAScot

EMERITUS PROFESSOR J V S MEGAW, AM CM MA DLITT FAHA FSA HONFSAScot MCIFA KMDAI

DIANA MURRAY, CBE MA FRSE FRSGS FSA HonFSAScot MCIfA MIOD

PROFESSOR COLIN RENFREW (LORD RENFREW OF KAIMSTHORN), ScD FSA FBA HonFSAScot

ANNA RITCHIE, OBE BA PhD FSA HonFSAScot

JANE RYDER, OBE MA WS FRSE FSA HonFSAScot

LISBETH THOMS, MBE BSc Dip.Archaeol HonFSAScot

PROFESSOR DR W GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE, HONFSAScot

# The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland was founded 18 December 1780 and instituted by a Royal Charter on 29 March 1783, with a Supplementary Charter awarded on 22 April 2019

It is a registered Scottish Charity No. SC010440

#### LAWS OF THE SOCIETY FROM 30 NOVEMBER 2020

- 1. The purpose of this Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESEARCH.
- 2. The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
- 3. Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by two Fellows. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not able to obtain two sponsor Fellows, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances and credentials of the candidate concerned, to waive the necessity for two sponsors from among the Fellowship.
- 4. Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. The method of voting will be prescribed by the Council.
- 5. Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed twenty-five.
- 6. Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, they shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 7.
- 7. Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on a date in each year specified by Council; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the defaulter may be removed from the Fellowship. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to re-join the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.

- 8. Fellows, including Honorary Fellows and Council members, whose actions or behaviour might in the opinion of Council bring the Society into disrepute may be removed from the Fellowship. Council will consider the amoval and advise the Fellow of its decision. Any Fellow so considered will be given the opportunity to appeal the decision to a panel independent of Council consisting of Fellows and at least one non-Fellow. The determination of this panel will be final.
- 9. Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed or electronic form Proceedings of the Society from the date of election.
- None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
- Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the 11. Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Eight members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes at least two Office-bearers and six elected members of Council.
- The Council shall consist of at least twelve Fellows elected by the Society, the Society repre-12. sentative of the National Museums Scotland (NMS) ex officio who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the NMS Board of Trustees) and up to two co-opted persons appointed by the Council to fill a vacancy on the Council. The total number of members of the Council shall not exceed fifteen at any time.
- The Office-bearers of the Council shall consist of a President, two Vice-Presidents and a Treasurer.
- The President shall be elected for a period of up to three years and may stand for election as President for a second term, subject to Law 16 below. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and, subject to Law 16 below, shall be eligible for re-election provided however that the term of office of the President and the Treasurer respectively may not exceed six years in total. The elections of the President and the Treasurer shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.
- The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed by the Council from amongst the elected members of the Council. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed for an initial term of up to three years and may be appointed for a further term of up to three years, subject to Law 16 below.
- Elected members of the Council shall hold office as Council members for an initial term of up to three years. A retiring Member of the Council who has held office for one term shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council and, if so re-elected, shall hold office for a further term of up to three years. The election shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meeting upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least 14 days before the meeting.
- A retiring member of the Council who has held office for two terms shall not be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council unless such re-election is as an Office-bearer of the Council, provided however that no person shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council in any circumstances if such re-election would result in that person's period of membership of the Council in any capacity exceeding nine years unless a period of at least two years has elapsed since the date of that person's previous retirement from the Council.

- 18. A co-opted member of the Council shall be eligible for election as a member of the Council in accordance with Law 15 at the next Annual General Meeting following their appointment as a co-opted member of the Council and shall vacate office at the conclusion of that Annual General Meeting if they are not elected as a member of the Council. Immediately following each Annual General Meeting, the Council may re-appoint under Law 11 any individual who, as a co-opted member of the Council, vacated office under this Law at the conclusion of an Annual General Meeting; the Council may alternatively appoint someone in their place or resolve not to fill the vacancy.
- 19. Vacancies among the elected members of Council, the President and the Treasurer occurring by completion of term of office, by resignation, death or otherwise shall be filled by election at the Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council.
- 20. The Council may appoint committees or individuals to advise on the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties
- 21. The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30th November, or on the preceding or the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.
- 22. The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
- 23. Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 20, shall be held in each year.
- 24. Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.