

PROCEEDINGS  
of the  
Society of Antiquaries  
of Scotland



Volume 145  
(2015)

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland  
National Museums Scotland  
Chambers Street, Edinburgh

This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Requests for permission to reproduce material from the *Proceedings* should be sent to the Managing Editor (editor@socantscot.org), as well as to the author, illustrator, photographer or other copyright holder.

Copyright in the *Proceedings* rests with the Society and the individual authors. It is permitted, without the need for specific authorisation or payment of a fee, to photocopy:

- i. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for the private use of an individual;
- ii. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use;
- iii. multiple copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for a non-profit-making institution for educational use within that institution only.

The consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, the creation of new collective works or resale.

*The online versions of the following papers are available Open Access under the terms of the specified licences:*

‘Containment, closure and red deer: a Late Neolithic butchery site at Skaill Bay, Mainland Orkney’ 91-124. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

‘The survey and analysis of brochs’ 153-176. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

‘An Iron Age burial with weapons, on a site with evidence of medieval and post-medieval occupation from Dunbar, East Lothian’ 177-212. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

‘Tullich, Aberdeenshire: a reappraisal of an early ecclesiastical site and its carved stones in the light of recent excavations’ 229-281. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial Licence: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is a registered Scottish charity No. SC010440

ISSN 0081-1564

Typeset by Waverley Typesetters, Warham, Norfolk  
Manufactured in Great Britain by Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow

Published December 2016

# Contents

- v LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
- vii EDITORIAL BOARD
- ix COUNCIL
- xi PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS
- xiii LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND
- OBITUARIES
- 1 Alan Saville  
**Ian Ralston and Trevor Cowie**
- 13 Antony Charles Thomas  
**Stephen T Driscoll**
- ARTICLES AND REPORTS
- 17 Scotland's intertidal prehistory: Lub Dubh Aird, a raw material and knapping site in Upper Loch Torridon  
**Karen Hardy, Jonathan Benjamin, Andrew Bicket, John McCarthy and Torben Ballin**
- 41 The Knowe of Rowiegar, Rousay, Orkney: description and dating of the human remains and context relative to neighbouring cairns  
**Margaret Hutchison, Neil Curtis and Ray Kidd**
- 91 Containment, closure and red deer: a Late Neolithic butchery site at Skaill Bay, Mainland, Orkney  
**Colin Richards, Ann Clarke, Claire Ingrem, Jacqui Mulville and Ingrid Mainland**
- 125 The land before symbol stones: a geophysical survey of Rhynie, Aberdeenshire, and the excavation of a Middle Bronze Age structure near the Craw Stane, Barflat  
**Meggen Gondek and Gordon Noble**
- 153 The survey and analysis of brochs  
**Graeme Cavers, John Barber and Matthew Ritchie**

- 177 An Iron Age burial with weapons, on a site with evidence of medieval and post-medieval occupation from Dunbar, East Lothian  
**Mike Roy**
- 213 Gods and monsters in Roman Scotland: recent finds of Roman figural bronzes  
**Fraser Hunter**
- 229 Tullich, Aberdeenshire: a reappraisal of an early ecclesiastical site and its carved stones in the light of recent excavations  
**Jane Geddes, Hilary K Murray and J Charles Murray**
- 283 *Ecclesia Ludens*: board and dice games in a Scottish monastic context  
**Mark Hall**
- 299 ‘Ardvonrig’, Isle of Barra: an appraisal of the location of a Scandinavian accompanied burial  
**Shane McLeod**
- 307 A medieval logboat from the River Conon: towards an understanding of riverine transport in Highland Scotland  
**Robert J C Mowat, Trevor Cowie, Anne Crone and Graeme Cavers**
- 341 Craggie bloomery: iron working in late medieval Sutherland  
**John A Atkinson and John Wombell**
- 349 Excavations at Achanduin Castle, Lismore, Argyll, 1970–5: findings and commentary  
**David H Caldwell, Geoffrey P Stell, and the late Dennis J Turner**
- 371 Seventh century or seventeenth century? Identifying glass beads from Scotland  
**Alice Blackwell and Susanna Kirk**  
*This paper was awarded the RBK Stevenson Award*
- 401 The French cartographer and the clan chief: archaeological fieldwork in Perthshire, 1763  
**Lawrence Keppie**
- 427 Alexander Henry Rhind (1833–63): a Scottish antiquary in Egypt  
**Claire Gilmour**
- 441 INDEX

## List of abbreviations commonly used in the *Proceedings*

ADS	Archaeology Data Service
AIA	Association for Industrial Archaeology
ALGAO	Association of Local Government Archaeology Officers
BAR	British Archaeology Reports
CBA	Council for British Archaeology
CIfA	Chartered Institute for Archaeologists
CSA	Council for Scottish Archaeology (now Archaeology Scotland)
DES	Discovery and Excavation in Scotland
DSR	Data Structure Report
HER	Historic Environment Record
HES	Historic Environment Scotland
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
NMR	National Monuments Record
NMRS	National Monuments Record Scotland
NMS	National Museums Scotland
OS	Ordnance Survey
OSA	Old Statistical Account 1791–99
RCAHMS	Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
SAIR	Scottish Archaeological Internet Reports
SMR	Sites and Monuments Record



# Editorial Board for the *Proceedings* vol 145

## *Editors*

ERIN OSBORNE-MARTIN, BA MPhil

LAWRIE LAW

## *Editorial Board*

DONAL BATESON, BA PhD FSA Scot

PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA FL Dr hc FSA HonFSA Scot FBA MCIfA

PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonFSA Scot HonMCIfA

MIKE CHURCH, BSc(Hons) PhD FSA Scot

PROFESSOR JOHN COLLIS, MA PhD FSA MCIfA

PROFESSOR GORDON COOK, BA PhD FSA Scot

VIKKI CUMMINGS, PhD FSA FSA Scot MCIfA

PROFESSOR JANE DOWNES, BA(Hons) PhD FSA Scot MCIfA

PROFESSOR STEVE DRISCOLL, BA MSc PhD FSA FSA Scot

PROFESSOR KEVIN EDWARDS, MA PhD FRGS CGeog FSA FRSE FSA Scot

PROFESSOR WILLIAM GILLIES, BA MA FSA Scot

ANNA GROUNDWATER, PhD FRHistS FSA Scot

STRAT HALLIDAY, BSc FSA Scot

PROFESSOR DENNIS HARDING, MA DPhil FRSE FSA Scot

FRASER HUNTER, BSc PhD FSA FSA Scot

HEATHER JAMES, BA PhD FSA Scot MCIfA

BRENDAN O'CONNOR, BA DPhil FSA FSA Scot

PROFESSOR RICHARD ORAM, MA PhD FSA FSA Scot

PROFESSOR IAN RALSTON, OBE MA PhD FSA FRSE FSA Scot MCIfA

ALAN SAVILLE, BA(Hons) FSA FSA Scot MCIfA†

RONAN TOOLIS, MA(Hons) FSA Scot MCIfA

CAROLINE WICKHAM-JONES, MA MSocSci FSA FSA Scot MCIfA

## *Indexer*

CATRIONA ARMIT

## *Publications Production Managers*

LAWRIE LAW

ALISON RAE

## *Office Manager*

JACQUI CLABBY, BA

## *Publications and Sales Administrator*

VASILIKI KOUTRAFOURI, MA(Hons) PhD

ROZA DIMITRELLOU, BA MSc





# Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council from 1 December 2014

(DATE OF ELECTION AND RETIREMENT IN BRACKETS)

## *President*

DAVID CALDWELL, MA PhD FSA (elected 1 December 2014)

## *Vice-Presidents*

ANN MACSWEEN, MA(Hons) MA MSc PhD FSA MCIfA MRTPI (elected 30 November 2012)

BEVERLEY BALLIN SMITH, BEd MA FSA MCIfA (elected 30 November 2013)

## *Treasurer*

STEPHEN CARTER, BSc PhD MCIfA (re-elected 1 December 2014)

## *Councillors*

TOM DAWSON, BA(Hons) (elected 30 November 2012)

IAIN FRASER, MA(Hons) PhD (elected 30 November 2012)

ANNA GROUNDWATER, PhD FRHistS (elected 30 November 2012)

BRUCE MANN, MA MCIfA (elected 30 November 2013)

JANE RYDER, OBE MA (elected 30 November 2013; resigned 20 April 2015)

EWEN D SMITH, MA MLitt (elected 30 November 2013)

LUKE WORMALD, BA(Hons) MSc (elected 30 November 2013)

## *Ex Officio Members of Council*

### *Chair of the Aberdeen and North-East Section*

FINLAY MCKICHAN, MA MLitt FSA Scot (elected 9 May 2012; retired 14 April 2015)

JACKSON ARMSTRONG, BA MPhil PhD FSA Scot (elected 14 April 2015)

### *Representative of the National Museums Scotland*

FRASER HUNTER, BSc PhD FSA FSA Scot (appointed 2005)



# Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

## Patron

HM THE QUEEN

## Honorary Fellows

HRH THE DUKE OF ROTHESAY

DR ROBERT GEOFFREY WILLIAM ANDERSON, BSC MA DPhil FSA FRSE FRSCChem

MR C NEAL ASCHERSON

PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA FSA FI Dr hc FBA MCIfA

PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonMCIfA

AUBREY BURL, MA DLitt PhD FSA

ARKITEKT HAKON CHRISTIE

PROFESSOR EMERITUS MARTIN CARVER, BSc Dip.Archaeol FSA

PROFESSOR EMERITUS JOHN COLES, MA PhD ScD FSA FBA FIDhc FRSA HonMCIfA HonMRIA

PROFESSOR EMERITUS ROSEMARY CRAMP, CBE MA BLitt FSA FBA

JOHN GREENWELL DUNBAR, OBE MA FSA HonFRIAS

PROFESSOR EMERITUS GEORGE EOGAN, BA PhD DLitt LittD FSA MRIA

ISABEL HENDERSON, OBE MA PhD

MISS AUDREY SHORE HENSHALL, OBE MA FSA

PROFESSOR EMERITUS DR LEENDERT P LOUWE KOOIJMANS

PROFESSOR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN

PROFESSOR EMERITUS J V S MEGAW, AM MA DLitt FAHA FSA MCIfA

PROFESSOR ROGER J MERCER, OBE MA FSA FRSE HonMCIfA

PROFESSOR KLAUS RANDBORG

PROFESSOR EMERITUS COLIN RENFREW (Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn), BA MA PhD ScD HonDLitt  
FSA FBA

DR ANNA RITCHIE, OBE BA PhD FSA

PROFESSOR EMERITUS CHARLES THOMAS, CBE DL DLitt HonDLitt FSA FBA HonMRIA†

PROFESSOR EMERITUS J D VAN DER WAALS

PROFESSOR EMERITUS DR WILLY GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE



# The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland was founded 18 December 1780 and incorporated by Royal Charter 6 May 1783

*It is a registered Scottish Charity No SC010440*

## LAWS OF THE SOCIETY FROM 1 DECEMBER 2014

1. The purpose of this Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
2. The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
3. Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by two Fellows. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not able to obtain two sponsor Fellows, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances and credentials of the candidate concerned, to waive the necessity for two sponsors from among the Fellowship.
4. Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. Fellows may vote against any candidate by striking out the name from the list and returning the list to the Society before the meeting or placing the list in the Ballot Box before the meeting commences. Candidates receiving ten or more adverse votes will be balloted for individually at the meeting, and any candidate then receiving less than two-thirds of the votes shall not be admitted.
5. Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed twenty-five.
6. Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, he or she shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 7.
7. Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on 1st July in each year for that year then beginning; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the name of the defaulter may be erased from the List of Fellows. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to re-join the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription – in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available – or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.
8. Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed or electronic form Proceedings of the Society from the date of election.

9. None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
10. Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Eight members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes at least two Office-bearers and six elected members of Council.
11. The Council shall consist of at least eleven Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North East Section *ex officio*, the Society representative of the National Museums Scotland (NMS) *ex officio* who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the NMS Board of Trustees) and up to two co-opted persons appointed by the Council to fill a vacancy on the Council. The total number of members of the Council shall not exceed fifteen at any time.
12. The Office-bearers of the Council shall consist of a President, two Vice-Presidents and a Treasurer.
13. The President shall be elected for a period of up to three years and may stand for election as President for a second term, subject to Law 16 below. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and, subject to Law 16 below, shall be eligible for re-election provided however that the term of office of the President and the Treasurer respectively may not exceed six years in total. The elections of the President and the Treasurer shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.
14. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed by the Council from amongst the elected members of the Council. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed for an initial term of up to three years and may be appointed for a further term of up to three years, subject to Law 16 below.
15. Elected members of the Council shall hold office as Council members for an initial term of up to three years. A retiring Member of the Council who has held office for one term shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council and, if so re-elected, shall hold office for a further term of up to three years. The election shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meeting upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least 14 days before the meeting.
16. A retiring member of the Council who has held office for two terms shall not be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council unless such re-election is as an Office-bearer of the Council, provided however that no person shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council in any circumstances if such re-election would result in that person's period of membership of the Council in any capacity exceeding nine years unless a period of at least two years has elapsed since the date of that person's previous retirement from the Council.
17. A co-opted member of the Council shall be eligible for election as a member of the Council in accordance with Law 15 at the next Annual General Meeting following their appointment as a co-opted member of the Council and shall vacate office at the conclusion of that Annual General Meeting if they are not elected as a member of the Council. Immediately following each Annual General Meeting, the Council may re-appoint under Law 11 any individual who, as a co-opted member of the Council, vacated office under this Law at the conclusion of an Annual General Meeting; the Council may alternatively appoint someone in their place or resolve not to fill the vacancy.
18. Vacancies among the elected members of Council, the President and the Treasurer occurring by completion of term of office, by resignation, death or otherwise shall be filled by election at the

Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council.

19. The Council may appoint committees or individuals to advise on the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.
20. The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30th November, or on the preceding or the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.
21. The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
22. Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 20, shall be held in each year.
23. Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.