PROCEEDINGS of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

Volume 146
(2016)

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland
National Museums Scotland
Chambers Street, Edinburgh

This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Requests for permission to reproduce material from the *Proceedings* should be made via the Society website: http://www.socantscot.org/publications/copyrightpermissions/.

Copyright in the *Proceedings* rests with the Society and the individual authors. It is permitted, without the need for specific authorisation or payment of a fee, to photocopy:

i. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for the private use of an individual;
ii. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use;
iii. multiple copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for a non-profit-making institution for educational use within that institution only.

The consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, the creation of new collective works or resale.

The online versions of the following papers are available Open Access under the terms of the specified licences:

'Archaeological excavations at Nethermills Farm, Deeside, 1978-81' 7–55. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

'The end of the world, or just "goodbye to all that"? Contextualising the red deer heap from Links of Noltland, Westray, within late 3rd-millennium cal BC Orkney' 57–89. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

'Musical tuning peg from Edinburgh Castle and the stringing of medieval harps' 167–180. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

'Kisimul, Isle of Barra. Part 1: The Castle and the MacNeills' 181–213. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is a registered Scottish charity No. SC010440

ISSN 0081-1564

Typeset by Waverley Typesetters, Warham, Norfolk
Manufactured in Great Britain by Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow

Published December 2017

Contents

v LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

vii EDITORIAL BOARD

ix COUNCIL

xi PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS

xiii LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND

OBITUARY

1 Klavs Randsborg
Richard Hodges

ARTICLES AND REPORTS

7 Archaeological excavations at Nethermills Farm, Deeside, 1978–81
Caroline R Wickham-Jones, James B Kenworthy†, Aoife Gould, Gavin MacGregor and Gordon Noble

57 The end of the world, or just 'goodbye to all that'? Contextualising the red deer heap from Links of Noltland, Westray, within late 3rd-millennium cal BC Orkney
David Clarke, Alison Sheridan, Alexandra Shepherd, Niall Sharples, Miranda Armour-Chelu, Laura Hamlet, Christopher Bronk Ramsey, Elaine Dunbar, Paula Reimer, Peter Marshall and Alasdair Whittle

91 A cremation pit at Howford, Strichen, Aberdeenshire
Moira Greig

103 Cist behind the Binns: the excavation of an Iron Age cist burial at the House of the Binns, West Lothian
Daniel Rhodes and Elizabeth Jones

This paper was awarded the RBK Stevenson Award

113 A whetstone from south-east England at Newstead, Melrose (*Trimontium*): the reach of a major Roman stone industry
J R L Allen

121 Early medieval shellfish gathering at the Sands of Forvie, Aberdeenshire: feast or famine?
Gordon Noble, Joe Turner, Derek Hamilton, Lee Hastie, Rick Knecht, Lindsey Stirling, Oskar Sveinbjarnarson, Beth Upex and Karen Milek

153 A house-shaped shrine in a Carolingian setting, as depicted in the oldest portrait of St Columba in Cod Sang 555

Peter Yeoman

167 Musical tuning peg from Edinburgh Castle and the stringing of medieval harps

Graeme Lawson

181 Kisimul, Isle of Barra. Part 1: The Castle and the MacNeills

Tim Holden

215 Woodland management in medieval Scotland

John M Gilbert

253 The 'Roman Heads' at the Netherbow in Edinburgh: a case of antiquarian wishful thinking in the 18th and 19th centuries

Iain Gordon Brown and Alan Montgomery

275 The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland, Angus Graham and Gordon Childe (1935–46)

George F Geddes

311 INDEX

List of abbreviations commonly used in the *Proceedings*

ADS	Archaeology Data Service
AIA	Association for Industrial Archaeology
ALGAO	Association of Local Government Archaeological Officers
BAR	British Archaeological Reports
CBA	Council for British Archaeology
CIfA	Chartered Institute for Archaeologists
CSA	Council for Scottish Archaeology (now Archaeology Scotland)
DES	Discovery and Excavation in Scotland
DSR	Data Structure Report
HER	Historic Environment Record
HES	Historic Environment Scotland
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
NMR	National Monuments Record
NMRS	National Monuments Record Scotland
NMS	National Museums Scotland
OS	Ordnance Survey
OSA	Old Statistical Account 1791–99
RCAHMS	Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
SAIR	Scottish Archaeological Internet Reports
SMR	Sites and Monuments Record

Editorial Board for the *Proceedings* vol 146

Editors
Catherine Aitken, BA
Lawrie Law

Editorial Board
Donal Bateson, BA PhD FSA Scot
Professor Richard Bradley, MA FL Dr hc FSA HonFSA Scot FBA MCIfA
Professor David Breeze, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonFSA Scot HonMCIfA
Mike Church, BSc(Hons) PhD FSA Scot
Professor John Collis, MA PhD FSA MCIfA
Professor Gordon Cook, BA PhD FSA Scot
Vikki Cummings, PhD FSA FSA Scot MCIfA
Professor Jane Downes, BA(Hons) PhD FSA Scot MCIfA
Professor Steve Driscoll, BA MSc PhD FSA FSA Scot
Professor Kevin Edwards, MA PhD FRGS CGeog FSA FRSE FSA Scot
Professor William Gillies, BA MA FSA Scot
Anna Groundwater, PhD FRHistS FSA Scot
Strat Halliday, BSc FSA Scot
Professor Dennis Harding, MA DPhil FRSE FSA Scot
Fraser Hunter, BSc PhD FSA FSA Scot
Heather James, BA PhD FSA Scot MCIfA
Brendan O'Connor, BA DPhil FSA FSA Scot
Professor Richard Oram, MA PhD FSA FSA Scot
Professor Ian Ralston, OBE MA PhD FSA FRSE FSA Scot MCIfA
Ronan Toolis, MA(Hons) FSA Scot MCIfA
Caroline Wickham-Jones, MA MSocSci FSA FSA Scot MCIfA

Indexer
Linda Sutherland

Publications Production Managers
Lawrie Law
Alison Rae

Office Manager
Jacqui Clabby, BA

Publications and Sales Administrator
Roza Dimitrellou, BA MSc

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council from 1 December 2015

(DATE OF ELECTION AND RETIREMENT IN BRACKETS)

President

DAVID CALDWELL, MA PhD FSA (elected 1 December 2014)

Vice-President

BEVERLEY BALLIN SMITH, BEd MA FSA MCIfA (elected 30 November 2013)

Treasurer

STEPHEN CARTER, BSc PhD MCIfA (re-elected 1 December 2015)

Councillors

TOM DAWSON, BA(Hons) (re-elected 30 November 2015)
BARRY G FERGUSON, MA(Hons) (elected 30 November 2015)
ANNA GROUNDWATER, PhD FRHistS (re-elected 30 November 2015)
DAWN MCLAREN, MA(Hons) PhD MCIfA (elected 30 November 2015)
BRUCE MANN, MA MCIfA (elected 30 November 2013)
EWEN D SMITH, MA MLitt (elected 30 November 2013)
SHARON WEBB, BA(Hons) MPhil PhD (elected 30 November 2015)
ADELYN L M WILSON, LLB(Hons) PhD FHEA (elected 30 November 2015)
LUKE WORMALD, BA(Hons) MSc (elected 30 November 2013)

Ex Officio Members of Council

Chair of the Aberdeen and North-East Section

JACKSON ARMSTRONG, BA MPhil PhD FSA Scot (elected 14 April 2015)

Representative of the National Museums Scotland

GEORGE DALGLEISH, MA (appointed 4 August 2015)

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

Patron

HM The Queen

Honorary Fellows

HRH The Duke of Rothesay
Dr Robert Geoffrey William Anderson, BSC MA DPhil FSA FRSE FRSChem
Mr C Neal Ascherson
Professor Richard Bradley, MA FSA Fl Dr hc FBA MCIfA
Professor David Breeze, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonMCIfA
Aubrey Burl, MA DLitt PhD FSA
Professor Emeritus Martin Carver, BSc Dip.Archaeol FSA
Professor Emeritus John Coles, MA PhD ScD FSA FBA FlDhc FRSA HonMCIfA HonMRIA
Professor Emeritus Rosemary Cramp, CBE MA BLitt FSA FBA
John Greenwell Dunbar, OBE MA FSA HonFRIAS
Professor Emeritus George Eogan, BA PhD DLitt LittD FSA MRIA
Isabel Henderson, OBE MA PhD
Miss Audrey Shore Henshall, OBE MA FSA
Professor Emeritus Dr Leendert P Louwe Kooijmans
Professor Kristian Kristiansen
Professor Emeritus J V S Megaw, AM MA DLitt FAHA FSA MCIfA
Professor Roger J Mercer, OBE MA FSA FRSE HonMCIfA
Professor Emeritus Colin Renfrew (Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn), BA MA PhD ScD HonDLitt FSA FBA
Dr Anna Ritchie, OBE BA PhD FSA
Professor Emeritus J D Van Der Waals
Professor Emeritus Dr Willy Groenman-Van Waateringe

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland was founded 18 December 1780 and incorporated by Royal Charter 6 May 1783

It is a registered Scottish Charity No SC010440

LAWS OF THE SOCIETY FROM 1 DECEMBER 2014

1. The purpose of this Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
2. The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
3. Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by two Fellows. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not able to obtain two sponsor Fellows, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances and credentials of the candidate concerned, to waive the necessity for two sponsors from among the Fellowship.
4. Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. Fellows may vote against any candidate by striking out the name from the list and returning the list to the Society before the meeting or placing the list in the Ballot Box before the meeting commences. Candidates receiving ten or more adverse votes will be balloted for individually at the meeting, and any candidate then receiving less than two-thirds of the votes shall not be admitted.
5. Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed twenty-five.
6. Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, he or she shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 7.
7. Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on 1st July in each year for that year then beginning; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the name of the defaulter may be erased from the List of Fellows. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to re-join the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription – in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available – or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.
8. Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed or electronic form Proceedings of the Society from the date of election.

9. None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
10. Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Eight members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes at least two Office-bearers and six elected members of Council.
11. The Council shall consist of at least eleven Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North-East Section *ex officio*, the Society representative of the National Museums Scotland (NMS) *ex officio* who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the NMS Board of Trustees) and up to two co-opted persons appointed by the Council to fill a vacancy on the Council. The total number of members of the Council shall not exceed fifteen at any time.
12. The Office-bearers of the Council shall consist of a President, two Vice-Presidents and a Treasurer.
13. The President shall be elected for a period of up to three years and may stand for election as President for a second term, subject to Law 16 below. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and, subject to Law 16 below, shall be eligible for re-election provided however that the term of office of the President and the Treasurer respectively may not exceed six years in total. The elections of the President and the Treasurer shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.
14. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed by the Council from amongst the elected members of the Council. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed for an initial term of up to three years and may be appointed for a further term of up to three years, subject to Law 16 below.
15. Elected members of the Council shall hold office as Council members for an initial term of up to three years. A retiring Member of the Council who has held office for one term shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council and, if so re-elected, shall hold office for a further term of up to three years. The election shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meeting upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least 14 days before the meeting.
16. A retiring member of the Council who has held office for two terms shall not be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council unless such re-election is as an Office-bearer of the Council, provided however that no person shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council in any circumstances if such re-election would result in that person's period of membership of the Council in any capacity exceeding nine years unless a period of at least two years has elapsed since the date of that person's previous retirement from the Council.
17. A co-opted member of the Council shall be eligible for election as a member of the Council in accordance with Law 15 at the next Annual General Meeting following their appointment as a co-opted member of the Council and shall vacate office at the conclusion of that Annual General Meeting if they are not elected as a member of the Council. Immediately following each Annual General Meeting, the Council may re-appoint under Law 11 any individual who, as a co-opted member of the Council, vacated office under this Law at the conclusion of an Annual General Meeting; the Council may alternatively appoint someone in their place or resolve not to fill the vacancy.
18. Vacancies among the elected members of Council, the President and the Treasurer occurring by completion of term of office, by resignation, death or otherwise shall be filled by election at the

Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council.

19. The Council may appoint committees or individuals to advise on the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.

20. The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30th November, or on the preceding or the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.

21. The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.

22. Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 20, shall be held in each year.

23. Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.