

PROCEEDINGS
of the
Society of Antiquaries
of Scotland



Volume 148
(2018)

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland
National Museums Scotland
Chambers Street, Edinburgh

This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Requests for permission to reproduce material from the *Proceedings* should be made via the Society website: <http://www.socantscot.org/publications/copyrightpermissions/>

Copyright in the *Proceedings* rests with the Society and the individual authors. It is permitted, without the need for specific authorisation or payment of a fee, to photocopy:

- i. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for the private use of an individual;
- ii. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use;
- iii. multiple copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for a non-profit-making institution for educational use within that institution only.

The consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, the creation of new collective works or resale.

The online versions of the following papers are available Open Access under the terms of the specified licences:

‘Storm damage at Craig Phadrig hillfort, Inverness: results of the emergency archaeological evaluation’ 61–81. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

‘Interdisciplinary approaches to a connected landscape: upland survey in the northern Ochils’ 83–111. Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives Licence: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is a registered Scottish charity No. SC010440

ISSN 0081-1564
E-ISSN 2056-743X

Typeset by Waverley Typesetters, Warham, Norfolk
Manufactured in Great Britain by Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow

Published December 2019

Contents

- v LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
- vii EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD
- ix COUNCIL
- xi PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS
- xiii LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND
- OBITUARY
- 1 Professor Roger James Mercer
Diana Murray and Ian Ralston
- ARTICLES AND REPORTS
- 13 Neolithic pits and Late Bronze Age roundhouses in the Upper Ury Valley, Aberdeenshire
Claire Lingard and Richard Moore
- 49 ‘The Spearhead of the Pennon ...’: a Bronze Age spearhead carried into the Battle of Flodden?
Matthew G Knight and Trevor G Cowie
- 61 Storm damage at Craig Phadrig hillfort, Inverness: results of the emergency archaeological evaluation
Mary Peteranna and Steven Birch
- 83 Interdisciplinary approaches to a connected landscape: upland survey in the Northern Ochils
Michael Given, Oscar Aldred, Kevin Grant, Peter McNiven and Tessa Poller
- 113 Kinneddar: a major ecclesiastical centre of the Picts
Gordon Noble, Gemma Cruickshanks, Lindsay Dunbar, Nicholas Evans, Derek Hall, Derek Hamilton, Cathy MacIver, Edouard Masson-MacLean, James O’Driscoll, Lindsey Paskulin and Oskar Sveinbjarnarson
- 147 Abstract pattern on stone fragments from Applecross: the master carver of northern Pictland?
Cynthia Rose Thickpenny
This paper was awarded the RBK Stevenson Award

- 177 Inchinnan 5: the discovery and reconstruction of an early medieval carved stone
Megan Kasten
- 189 A Pictish ‘serpent’ incised slab from Jarlshof, Shetland
James Graham-Campbell and Isabel Henderson
- 209 Portraits of James I and James II, kings of Scots: some comparisons and a conjecture
Frederick Hepburn
- 231 John Stuart, Duke of Albany and his contribution to military science in Scotland and Italy, 1514–36: from Dunbar to Rome
Bryony Coombs
This paper was awarded the Murray Prize for History
- 267 The history of the Auldjo Jug 1830–60 – a review and critique: was Sir Walter Scott the real benefactor?
Michael Heafford
- 283 The anti-invasion defences of the Forth and Tay estuaries, eastern Scotland: 1900 to 1919
Gordon J Barclay and Ron Morris
- 333 Six O’Clock in Princes Street: an analysis of Wilfred Owen’s Edinburgh ‘re-education’
Neil McLennan
- 353 INDEX

List of abbreviations commonly used in the *Proceedings*

ADS	Archaeology Data Service
AIA	Association for Industrial Archaeology
ALGAO	Association of Local Government Archaeological Officers
BAR	British Archaeological Reports
CBA	Council for British Archaeology
CIfA	Chartered Institute for Archaeologists
CSA	Council for Scottish Archaeology (now Archaeology Scotland)
DES	Discovery and Excavation in Scotland
DSR	Data Structure Report
HER	Historic Environment Record
HES	Historic Environment Scotland
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
NMR	National Monuments Record
NMRS	National Monuments Record Scotland
NMS	National Museums Scotland
OS	Ordnance Survey
OSA	Old Statistical Account 1791–99
RCAHMS	Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
SAIR	Scottish Archaeological Internet Reports
SMR	Sites and Monuments Record

Editorial Advisory Board for the *Proceedings* vol 148

Managing Editors

CATHERINE AITKEN, BA
ADELA RAUCHOVA, MA

Editorial Advisory Board

PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonFSA Scot HonMCIfA
MIKE CHURCH, BSc(Hons) PhD FSA Scot
PROFESSOR JOHN COLLIS, MA PhD FSA MCIfA
PROFESSOR GORDON COOK, BA PhD FSA Scot
VICKI CUMMINGS, PhD FSA FSA Scot MCIfA
PROFESSOR JANE DOWNES, BA(Hons) PhD FSA Scot MCIfA
PROFESSOR STEVE DRISCOLL, BA MSc PhD FSA FSA Scot
PROFESSOR KEVIN EDWARDS, MA PhD FRGS CGeog FSA FRSE FSA Scot
PROFESSOR WILLIAM GILLIES, BA MA FSA Scot
ANNA GROUNDWATER, PhD FRHistS FSA Scot
STRAT HALLIDAY, BSc FSA Scot
PROFESSOR DENNIS HARDING, MA DPhil FRSE FSA Scot
FRASER HUNTER, BSc PhD FSA FSA Scot
HEATHER JAMES, BA PhD FSA Scot MCIfA
BRENDAN O'CONNOR, BA DPhil FSA FSA Scot
PROFESSOR RICHARD ORAM, MA PhD FSA FSA Scot
PROFESSOR IAN RALSTON, OBE MA PhD FSA FRSE FSA Scot MCIfA
RONAN TOOLIS, MA(Hons) FSA Scot MCIfA
CAROLINE WICKHAM-JONES, MA MSocSci FSA FSA Scot MCIfA

Indexer

JULITTA CLANCY

Publications Production Manager

LAWRIE LAW

Office Manager

JACQUI CLABBY, BA

Publications Officer

CHARLOTTE WHITING, BA

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council from 30 November 2017

(DATE OF ELECTION AND RETIREMENT IN BRACKETS)

President

DAVID CALDWELL, MA PhD FSA (re-elected 30 November 2017)

Vice-President

TOM DAWSON, BA(Hons) (re-elected 30 November 2015, appointed Vice-President 19 December 2016)

BARRY G FERGUSON, MA(Hons) (30 November 2015, appointed Vice-President 19 December 2016)

Treasurer

STEPHEN CARTER, BSc PhD MCIfA (re-elected 30 November 2017)

Councillors

DAWN McLAREN, MA(Hons) PhD MCIfA (30 November 2015)

SHARON WEBB, BA(Hons) MPhil PhD (30 November 2015)

HEATHER JAMES, MSc BA(Hons) PhD MCIfA (30 November 2016)

Co-opted Members of Council (date of co-option in brackets)

DEBORAH LAMB, MA (Cantab) PhD (appointed 18 December 2017)

Ex Officio Members of Council

Chair of the Aberdeen and North-East Section

JACKSON ARMSTRONG, BA MPhil PhD FSA Scot (elected 14 April 2015, stood down 24 April 2018)

NEIL CURTIS, MA MLitt AMA (elected 24 April 2018)

Representative of the National Museums Scotland

XERXES MAZDA, PhD (appointed 29 August 2016)

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

Patron

Her Majesty The Queen

Honorary Fellows (HonFSA Scot)

HRH PRINCE CHARLES THE PRINCE OF WALES, THE DUKE OF ROTHESAY

DR ROBERT ANDERSON, BSc MA DPhil FSA FRSE FRSCHEM

MR C NEAL ASCHERSON

PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA FSA FIDhc FBA MCIfA

PROFESSOR DAVID J BREEZE, OBE BA PhD FSA FRSE HonDLitt HonMCIfA

MR AUBREY BURL, MA DLitt PhD FSA

PROFESSOR MARTIN CARVER, BSc Dip.Archaeol FSA

PROFESSOR JOHN COLES, MA PhD ScD FSA FBA FIDhc FRSA HonMCIfA HonMRIA

EMERITUS PROFESSOR TED COWAN, MA FRSE

DAME EMERITUS PROFESSOR ROSEMARY CRAMP, DBE MA BLitt FSA FBA

PROFESSOR GEORGE EOGAN, BA PhD DLitt LittD FSA MRIA

DR ISABEL HENDERSON, OBE MA(Abdn) MA, PhD(Camb)

MS AUDREY SHORE HENSHALL, OBEMAFSA

PROFESSOR DR LEENDERT KOOLJMAN

PROFESSOR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN, HonFSA HonMEAA

EMERITUS PROFESSOR J V S MEGAW, AM MA DLitt FAHA FSA MCIfA

PROFESSOR ROGER MERCER, OBE MA FSA FRSE HonMCIfA

PROFESSOR COLIN RENFREW (LORD RENFREW OF KAIMSTHORN), ScD FSA FBA

DR ANNA RITCHIE, OBE BA PhD FSA

EMERITUS PROFESSOR J DIDERIK VAN DER WAALS, DLIT

PROFESSOR DR W GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland was founded 18 December 1780 and incorporated by Royal Charter 6 May 1783

It is a registered Scottish Charity No SC010440

LAWS OF THE SOCIETY FROM 1 DECEMBER 2014

1. The purpose of this Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
2. The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
3. Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by two Fellows. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not able to obtain two sponsor Fellows, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances and credentials of the candidate concerned, to waive the necessity for two sponsors from among the Fellowship.
4. Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. Fellows may vote against any candidate by striking out the name from the list and returning the list to the Society before the meeting or placing the list in the Ballot Box before the meeting commences. Candidates receiving ten or more adverse votes will be balloted for individually at the meeting, and any candidate then receiving less than two-thirds of the votes shall not be admitted.
5. Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed 25.
6. Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, he or she shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 7.
7. Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on 1st July in each year for that year then beginning; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the name of the defaulter may be erased from the List of Fellows. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to re-join the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription – in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available – or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.
8. Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the Proceedings of the Society in printed or electronic form from the date of election.

9. None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
10. Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Eight members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes at least two Office-bearers and six elected members of Council.
11. The Council shall consist of at least eleven Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North-East Section *ex officio*, the Society representative of the National Museums Scotland (NMS) *ex officio* who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the NMS Board of Trustees) and up to two co-opted persons appointed by the Council to fill a vacancy on the Council. The total number of members of the Council shall not exceed fifteen at any time.
12. The Office-bearers of the Council shall consist of a President, two Vice-Presidents and a Treasurer.
13. The President shall be elected for a period of up to three years and may stand for election as President for a second term, subject to Law 16 below. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and, subject to Law 16 below, shall be eligible for re-election provided however that the term of office of the President and the Treasurer respectively may not exceed six years in total. The elections of the President and the Treasurer shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.
14. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed by the Council from amongst the elected members of the Council. The Vice-Presidents shall be appointed for an initial term of up to three years and may be appointed for a further term of up to three years, subject to Law 16 below.
15. Elected members of the Council shall hold office as Council members for an initial term of up to three years. A retiring Member of the Council who has held office for one term shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council and, if so re-elected, shall hold office for a further term of up to three years. The election shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meeting upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least 14 days before the meeting.
16. A retiring member of the Council who has held office for two terms shall not be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council unless such re-election is as an Office-bearer of the Council, provided however that no person shall be eligible for re-election as a member of the Council in any circumstances if such re-election would result in that person's period of membership of the Council in any capacity exceeding nine years unless a period of at least two years has elapsed since the date of that person's previous retirement from the Council.
17. A co-opted member of the Council shall be eligible for election as a member of the Council in accordance with Law 15 at the next Annual General Meeting following their appointment as a co-opted member of the Council and shall vacate office at the conclusion of that Annual General Meeting if they are not elected as a member of the Council. Immediately following each Annual General Meeting, the Council may re-appoint under Law 11 any individual who, as a co-opted member of the Council, vacated office under this Law at the conclusion of an Annual General Meeting; the Council may alternatively appoint someone in their place or resolve not to fill the vacancy.
18. Vacancies among the elected members of Council, the President and the Treasurer occurring by completion of term of office, by resignation, death or otherwise shall be filled by election at the

Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council.

19. The Council may appoint committees or individuals to advise on the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.
20. The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30th November, or on the preceding or the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.
21. The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
22. Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 20, shall be held in each year.
23. Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.