PROCEEDINGS of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland



Volume 126 (1996)

Royal Museum of Scotland Chambers Street · Edinburgh

EDITORIAL BOARD 1995-6

Editor Jerry O'Sullivan, BA FSA Scot MIFA

Editorial Board J N Graham Ritchie, MA MBA PhD FSA FSA Scot (Convener)

Colleen Batey, BA PhD MIFA

Iain G Brown, MA, PhD FSA FRSA FSA Scot

Thomas O Clancy, BA PhD George Dalgleish, MA FSA Scot Doreen Grove, BA FSA Scot

Roderick McCullagh, BA Dip Arch Sci FSA Scot

George Haggarty, FSA Scot

Ann MacSween, MA MA PhD FSA Scot AIFA

Gordon S Maxwell, MA FSA PSA Scot

Athol L Murray, MA PhD LLB FRHistS FSA Scot

Alan Saville, BA FSA FSA Scot MIFA

Indexer Elizabeth Fowler, MA BLitt FSA Scot

Editorial Consultant Editorial Assistant Duncan McAra OStJ DipPub FSA Scot

Olivia Lelong M Phil

Where indicated maps have been based upon Ordnance Survey mapping with the permission of The Controller of HMSO. © Crown Copyright 82871M

ISSN 0081-1564

Produced by Sutton Publishing Limited, Phoenix Mill, Thrupp, Stroud, Gloucestershire GL5 2BU Printed in Great Britain by Butler & Tanner, Frome, Somerset

Table of Contents

Note: 'f' appended to page numbers indicates that part of the report is on microfiche in the envelope at the back of the volume.

Page	
ix	Laws of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland
xi	EDITORIAL
xiii	OBITUARY Stuart Piggott
	ARTICLES AND REPORTS
1	An unusual lithic assemblage from Lunanhead, Angus C R Wickham-Jones & J R Mackenzie
17	A Neolithic ring-mound at Midtown of Pitglassie, Auchterless, Aberdeenshire Alexandra Shepherd
53	Excavation of a kerbed funerary monument at Stoneyfield, Raigmore, Inverness, Highland, 1972–3 Derek D A Simpson
87	The disclosure of sacred ground: structural developments within megalithic monuments of the Clava group Conor MacCarthy
103	The excavation of two Bronze Age burial cairns at Bu Farm, Rapness, Westray, Orkney John Barber, Alan Duffy & Jerry O'Sullivan
121f	Four short cists from north-east Scotland and Easter Ross Ian B M Ralston
157	The excavation of a succession of prehistoric round-houses at Cnoc Stanger, Reay, Caithness, Highland, 1981–2 Roger J Mercer
191	Excavation of cropmarks at Skateraw and Thorntonloch, East Lothian Jon Triscott
199f	Excavation of a promontory fort and a palisaded homestead at Lower Greenyards, Bannockburn, Stirling, 1982–5 James S Rideout (ed)

271	The Sands of Breckon, Yell, Shetland: archaeological survey and excavation in an area of eroding windblown sand Stephen Carter & David Fraser
303	Excavation at Kinneil fortlet on the Antonine Wall, 1980–1 Geoff B Bailey & John Cannel
347	Stream crossings on the Antonine Wall Geoff B Bailey
371	Men and mountains, or geographical determinism and the conquest of Scotland Pat Southern
387f	Excavations at the long cist cemetery on the Hallow Hill, St Andrews, Fife Edwina Proudfoot
455	The context of the Dupplin cross: a reconsideration Leslie Alcock & Elizabeth A Alcock
459	The horseman and the falcon: mounted falconers in Pictish sculpture Ann Carrington
469	Inchaffray Abbey, Perth & Kinross: excavation and research, 1987 Gordon Ewart
517	Archaeological excavations at Castle Sween, Knapdale, Argyll & Bute, 1989–90 Gordon Ewart & Jon Triscott
559	Dunstaffnage Castle, Argyll & Bute: excavations in the north tower and east range 1987–94 John H Lewis
605	Excavations at St Andrews, Castlecliffe, 1988–90 John H Lewis
689	Burgage plots of medieval Perth: the evidence from excavations at Canal Street Russel J Coleman
733	Backland activities in medieval Perth: excavations at Meal Vennel and Scott Stree Adrian Cox
823	Linlithgow Palace: an excavation in the west range and a note on finds from the palace David Caldwell & John Lewis

871	The dating of the tower-houses at Comlongon and Elphinstone Alastair Maxwell-Irving
881	Blackfriars of Stirling Ronald Page & Catherine Page
899	Post-Reformation Catholic symbolism: further and different examples Ian B D Bryce & Alasdair Roberts
911	Excavations at two sites in Old Aberdeen Alison Cameron, Anne Johnston & Judith Stones
929	Archaeological evidence for 18th-century medical practice in the Old Town of Edinburgh: excavations at 13 Infirmary Street and Surgeons' Square David Henderson, Mark Collard & Daniel A Johnston
943	Excavation and watching brief at Newbigging Pottery, Musselburgh, East Lothian George Haggerty & Alison McIntyre
963	LECTURE SUMMARIES
973	MEETINGS OF THE SOCIETY, 1995–6
985	INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS
989	INDEX

COUNCIL FOR 1995-6

President

Gordon S Maxwell MA, FSA

Vice-Presidents
Barbara E Crawford, MA PhD FSA
Naomi E A Tarrant, BA AMA
Ian A G Shepherd, MA FSA MIFA

Treasurer
Alan Saville, BA FSA MIFA

Councillors
Nicholas Dixon, MA PhD
Doreen Grove, BA
Colin C Richards, BA PhD
Neil G Taverner, BDS
Valerie E Dean
John S Dent, BA MPhil PhD FSA MIFA
Jane M S Durham, MBE
Michael D King, MA AMA
Colleen Batey, BA, PhD, MIFA
Thomas O Clancy, BA PhD
Brendan O'Connor, BA DPhil
Antoinette Watkins, BA

Ex Officio

Chairman of North East Section
Publications Convener
Research Convener
Finance & Administration Convener
Heritage Convener
Representative to the Ancient
Monuments Board of Scotland
Representative of the
National Museums of Scotland

Director

Proceedings Editor

Monographs Editor

Elizabeth Curtis, MA
J N Graham Ritchie, MA MBA PhD FSA
Alan Saville, BA FSA MIFA
Humphrey M Holmes, CA
Fionna M Ashmore, BA FSA
W David H Sellar, BA LLB FRHistS

David V Clarke, BA PhD FSA

Fionna M Ashmore, BA FSA Jerry O'Sullivan BA MIFA Alexandra N Shepherd, BA MIFA

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, 1995–6

Patron
HM THE QUEEN

Honorary Fellows

HRH THE DUKE OF ROTHESAY

EMERITUS PROFESSOR LESLIE ALCOCK, OBE MA FSA FRHISTS

PROFESSOR BERTIL ALMGREN

DR ROBERT GEOFFREY WILLIAM ANDERSON, BSc MA DPhil FRSC

MISS MARION CAMPBELL OF KILBERRY, FSA

RONALD GORDON CANT, MA DLitt FRHISTS

(ARKITEKT) HAKON CHRISTIE

DR J-B COLBERT de BEAULIEU

HOWARD COLVIN, CVP CBE FBA FSA

PROFESSOR ALEXANDER FENTON, CBE MA BA DLITT FRSE FSA

PROFESSOR PIERRE-ROLAND GIOT

MISS AUDREY SHORE HENSHALL, OBE MA FSA

ARNE HOFF, PhD

DR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN

PROFESSOR S J de LAET

PROFESSOR STUART PIGGOTT, CBE BLitt DLITTHum FSA FBA (Deceased September 1996)

Dr Antonie Plămădeală

Professor Dr Hans Schönberger

PROFESSOR AXEL STEENSBERG

DR WILLIAM E TAYLOR

PROFESSOR BRUCE TRIGGER, PhD, DSc, DLitt, FRSC

PROFESSOR J D VAN DER WAALS

PROFESSOR DR W GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE

LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND, INSTITUTED NOVEMBER 1780 AND INCORPORATED BY ROYAL CHARTER, 6 MAY 1783

- The purpose of the Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
- 2 The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
- Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by a Fellow. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not resident in the United Kingdom, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances to waive the necessity for a sponsor.
- 4 Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least ten days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. Fellows may vote against any candidate by striking out the name from the list and returning the list to the Society before the meeting or placing the list in the Ballot Box before the meeting commences. Candidates receiving ten or more adverse votes will be balloted for individually at the meeting, and any candidate then receiving less than two-thirds of the votes shall not be admitted.
- 5 Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed twenty-five.
- 6 Corresponding Members must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows. They shall not be liable for a fee for admission or annual subscription. This Law is now repealed.
- 7 Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, he or she shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 8.
- Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on 1st July in each year for that year then beginning; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the name of the defaulter may be erased from the list of Fellows. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to rejoin the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the *Proceedings*, if still available or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.
- 9 Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed *Proceedings* of the Society from the date of election.
- 10 None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
- Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Five members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes one Office-bearer and one elected member of Council.
- 12 The Office-bearers shall consist of a President, three Vice-Presidents, and a Treasurer. The Presidents and the Vice-Presidents shall be elected for a period of three years. One of the Vice-Presidents shall retire annually by rotation, and shall not be eligible for re-election to the

same office until one year has elapsed. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and shall be eligible for re-election. The elections shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least fourteen days before the meeting.

- 13 The Council shall consist of the Office-bearers, twelve Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North East Section, the Conveners of the Programme, Publication, Research, Heritage and Finance and Administration Committees if not already elected members, the Society representative on the Ancient Monuments Board (nominated by the Secretary of State for Scotland) and a representative of the National Museums of Scotland who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the Board of Trustees).
- 14 Four of the twelve elected members of Council shall retire annually by rotation, and shall not be eligible for re-election as ordinary members of Council until one year has elapsed. Vacancies among the elected members of Council and Office-bearers occurring by completion of term of office, by retirement on rotation, by resignation, death or otherwise, shall be filled by election at the Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council. The election shall be by ballot, as provided for by Law 12.
- 15 The Council may appoint committees or individual to advise on or to take charge of particular departments of the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.
- 16 The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30th November, or on the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least fourteen days before the day of the meeting.
- 17 The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least fourteen days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
- 18 Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 16, shall be held in each year.
- 19 Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least thirty days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.

Editorial

Volume 126 of the *Proceedings* is the second in a series of unusually large, double-volumes (a third double-volume – Volume 127 – is projected for publication next year). In the 'Editorial' which introduced the last *Proceedings*, the then Editor, Mr Humphrey Welfare, explained the unusual circumstances in which these double-volumes have been generated; these circumstances were described at greater length in a paper in the same volume by members of Historic Scotland's Inspectorate of Ancient Monuments, Mr Gordon Barclay and Ms Olwyn Owen. In short, these double volumes represent the Society's collaboration with Historic Scotland in discharging a backlog of unpublished excavation reports from recent decades of fieldwork in Scotland. This is a large, but exceptionally worthwhile undertaking, as it guarantees that the record of archaeological investigations at sites and monuments of national importance is published to the highest standards available.

Despite the clear importance of these double volumes, they are not undertaken by the Society without some debate by Council, by the Editorial Board and indeed by the other committees of the Society which represent the Fellows' interests. One question frequently asked is: 'What sort of archaeological and historical writing do the Fellows really want?'. The excavation reports and shorter, synoptic papers in the following pages cast some new light on almost every period of human activity in Scotland and visit almost every part of the country. Thus, the Editorial Board hopes that it has achieved one primary aim in bringing to press something of real interest or use to each of the Society's Fellows.

However, all Fellows will acknowledge that the purpose of *Proceedings* must also be described in wider terms. The *Proceedings* is one of the oldest members of a family of British archaeological and historical journals; it is the national journal of Scotland. It is received each year, not only by individuals, but by several hundred museum, university and public libraries, both throughout Britain and in numerous other countries. As such, it fulfils a paramount aim of the Society in creating a public record of the history and archaeology of Scotland which is widely available, both to national and international readerships.

The distribution of the *Proceedings* is far-flung in time, as well as in space. The *Proceedings* has appeared continually since 1851. One of the more common sights in any archaeological workplace in Scotland – be it a museum, university department, field unit or even private study – is the extracts from earlier volumes describing investigations by successive generations of fieldworkers. Thus, from year to year, the *Proceedings* constitutes a living resource which is avidly quarried by each new generation of researchers.

In 1997 the 14th centenary of the death of one of Scotland's patron saints, St Columba of Derry and Iona, will have been celebrated. The first recorded notice of archaeological remains on Iona, by J Alfred Smyth, was published in Volume 12 of the *Proceedings* (1876–78); this was preceded by a discussion of the topography of the earliest monastic settlement by William Skene in the previous year (Vol 11: 1874–76). Since then, a dozen excavation reports and other papers have appeared in these pages, including work by R B K Stevenson (Vol 85: 1950–51), Mark Redknap (Vol 108: 1976–77), J N Graham Ritchie & Alan Lane (Vol 110: 1978–80), John Barber (Vol 111: 1981), P G Topping (Vol 115: 1985), Anne Hamlin (Vol 117: 1987), Elizabeth & Peter Fowler (Vol 118: 1988), Alison Haggarty (Vol 118: 1988), Finbarr McCormick (Vol 122: 1992) and the present writer (Vol 124: 1994). This single example suffices to show to what extent developments in Scottish archaeology march closely with the pages of the *Proceedings*; it is in this context that one welcomes the publication of so many new papers in the present double-volume.