PROCEEDINGS of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland



Volume 140 (2010)

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland National Museums Scotland Chambers Street, Edinburgh This volume has been printed on acid-free paper.

Requests for permission to reproduce material from the *Proceedings* should be sent to the Managing Editor (publications@socantscot.org), as well as to the author, illustrator, photographer or other copyright holder.

Copyright in the *Proceedings* rests with the Society and the individual authors. It is permitted, without the need for specific authorization or payment of a fee, to photocopy:

- i. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for the private use of an individual;
- ii. single copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for library reserve or short-term loan use;
- iii. multiple copies of individual papers or sections of the *Proceedings* for teaching use, provided that such copies are taken for a non-profit-making institution for educational use within that institution only.

The consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, advertising or promotional purposes, the creation of new collective works or resale.

Where indicated, maps have been based on Ordnance Survey maps by permission, © Crown Copyright.

The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is a registered Scottish charity No. SC 010440

ISSN 0081-1564

Typeset by Waverley Typesetters, Warham, Norfolk Manufactured in Slovenia

Published November 2011

Contents

- v LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
- vii EDITORIAL BOARD
- ix COUNCIL
- xi PATRON AND HONORARY FELLOWS
- xiii LAWS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND

ARTICLES AND REPORTS

1 Revisiting Quanterness: new AMS dates and stable isotope data from an Orcadian chamber tomb

Rick Schulting, Alison Sheridan, Rebecca Crozier and Eileen Murphy

51 Dating Balbirnie: recent radiocarbon dates from the stone circle and cairn at Balbirnie, Fife, and a review of its place in the overall Balfarg/Balbirnie site sequence

Alex Gibson

- 79 New light on oblong forts: excavations at Dunnideer, AberdeenshireMurray Cook
- 93 An early Antonine fort at Mumrills

Geoff Bailey

- 105 Early Historic settlement beneath the Grassmarket in Edinburgh James McMeekin
- 129 Urban morphology and medieval burgh development in Edinburgh and Elgin Robin Tait
- 145 Heraldic investigations anent early Murray genealogy Dr Bruce McAndrew
- Survey and excavation at Dunstaffnage Castle, Argyll
 Colin Breen, Wes Forsythe, John Raven and Daniel Rhodes
- 179 Argyll's Lodgings, Stirling: recent archaeological excavations and historical analysis Dennis Gallagher

- iv | TABLE OF CONTENTS
- 207 Another 18th-century reference to Arthur's Oven Philip Dunshea
- 211 ANNUAL REPORT
- 235 NOTES AND CONDITIONS FOR CONTRIBUTORS
- 243 INDEX

List of abbreviations commonly used in the Proceedings

- AIA Association for Industrial Archaeology
- ALGAO Association of Local Government Archaeology Officers
 - BAR British Archaeology Reports
 - CBA Council for British Archaeology
 - CSA Council for Scottish Archaeology (now Archaeology Scotland)
 - DES Discovery and Excavation in Scotland
 - DSR Data Structure Report
 - HMSO Her Majesty's Stationery Office
 - If A Institute for Archaeologists
 - NMR National Monuments Record
 - NMRS National Monuments Record Scotland
 - NMS National Museums Scotland
 - OS Ordnance Survey
 - OSA Old Statistical Account 1791–99
- RCAHMS Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
 - SAIR Scottish Archaeological Internet Reports
 - SMR Sites and Monuments Record

Editorial Board for the Proceedings vol 140

Editor Erin Osborne-Martin, BA

Editorial Board

PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA Fl Dr hc FSA HonFSAScot FBA MIfA PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonFSAScot HonIfA PROFESSOR MARTIN CARVER, BSc DipArchae FSA FSAScot MIfA PROFESSOR JOHN COLLIS, MA PhD FSA MIFA PROFESSOR GORDON COOK, BA PhD FSAScot PROFESSOR STEVE DRISCOLL, BA MSc PhD FSA FSAScot PROFESSOR KEVIN EDWARDS, MA PhD FRGS CGeog FSA FRSE FSAScot PROFESSOR WILLIAM GILLIES, BA MA FSAScot PROFESSOR DENNIS HARDING, MA DPhil FRSE FSAScot ISABEL HENDERSON, OBE MA PhD HonFSAScot JOHN HUME, BSc ARCST PhD FSAScot PROFESSOR TIM INGOLD, PhD FBA FRSE FSAScot PROFESSOR MICHAEL LYNCH, MA PhD FRHistS FRSE FSAScot PROFESSOR RICHARD ORAM, MA PhD FSA FSAScot PROFESSOR IAN RALSTON, OBE MA PhD FSA FRSE FSAScot MIfA ANNA RITCHIE, OBE BA PhD FSA HonFSAScot ALAN SAVILLE, BA FSA FSAScot MIfA ALISON SHERIDAN, BA MA PhD FSA FSAScot AIfA JIM TATE, BSc PhD MinstP FSAScot

Indexer Anne McCarthy

Publications Production Managers Lawrie Law Alison Rae

Office Manager Jacqui Clabby, BA

Publications and Sales Administrator VASILIKI KOUTRAFOURI, MA(Hons) PhD

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council from 1 December 2009

President

BARBARA CRAWFORD, MA PhD FSA FRSE

Vice-Presidents Ian Ralston, OBE MA PhD FRSE FSA MIfA George Dalgleish, MA Lesley Ferguson, MA

Treasurer Brendan O'Connor, BA DPhil FSA

Councillors IAIN BANKS, MA(Hons) PhD MIFA ALAN BRABY SHANNON M FRASER, MA Dip.Post-Ex. PhD MIFA RONAN TOOLIS, MA(Hons) MIFA STEPHEN CARTER, BSC PhD MIFA MALCOLM COOPER, BA MPhil DMS FSA FRSA MIFA DEREK HALL, Cert.Pract.Arch MIFA STRATFORD HALLIDAY, BSC GORDON NOBLE, BA AIFA JULIE GIBSON, BA AIFA STEPHEN HOLMES, MA BD PGCE NYREE FINLAY, MA PhD MIFA

Ex Officio Members of Council

Chairman of the North-East Section Convener of the Publications Committee Convener of the Research Committee Convener of the Fellowship Committee Representative of the National Museums of Scotland

Chris Croly David P Bowler, BA MPhil MIfA Shannon Fraser, MA Dip.Post-Ex. PhD MIfA George Dalgleish, MA

FRASER HUNTER, BSc PhD FSA

Director Simon Gilmour, MA(Hons) PhD FSA MIfA

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

Patron

HM THE QUEEN

Honorary Fellows

HRH THE DUKE OF ROTHESAY DR ROBERT GEOFFREY WILLIAM ANDERSON, BSC MA DPhil FSA FRSE FRSChem PROFESSOR EMERITUS GEOFFREY W S BARROW, MA BLitt DLitt FSA FBA FRSE PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA FSA Fl Dr hc FBA MIfA PROFESSOR DAVID BREEZE, OBE BA PhD Hon DLitt FSA FRSE HonIfA AUBREY BURL, MA DLitt PhD FSA ARKITEKT HAKON CHRISTIE PROFESSOR EMERITUS JOHN COLES, MA PhD ScD FSA FBA FIDhc FRSA HonMIfA HonMRIA PROFESSOR EMERITUS ROSEMARY CRAMP, CBE MA BLitt FSA FBA JOHN GREENWELL DUNBAR, OBE MA FSA HONFRIAS PROFESSOR EMERITUS GEORGE EOGAN, BA PhD DLitt LittD FSA MRIA PROFESSOR EMERITUS ALEXANDER FENTON, CBE MA BA DLitt HonDLitt FSA FRSE HRSA ISABEL HENDERSON, OBE MA PhD MISS AUDREY SHORE HENSHALL, OBE MA FSA PROFESSOR EMERITUS DR LEENDERT P LOUWE KOOIJMANS PROFESSOR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN **PROFESSOR KLAVS RANDSBORG** PROFESSOR EMERITUS COLIN RENFREW (Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn), BA MA PhD ScD HonDLitt FSA FBA DR ANNA RITCHIE, OBE BA PhD FSA PROFESSOR EMERITUS CHARLES THOMAS, CBE DL DLitt HonDLitt FSA FBA HonMRIA PROFESSOR EMERITUS J D VAN DER WAALS PROFESSOR EMERITUS DR WILLY GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE

Laws of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, instituted 18 December 1780 and incorporated by Royal Charter, 6 May 1783

- 1. The purpose of the Society shall be the study of the ANTIQUITIES AND HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, more especially by means of Archaeological Research.
- 2. The Society shall consist of Fellows and Honorary Fellows.
- 3. Candidates for admission as Fellows must sign the Form of Application prescribed by the Council, and must be sponsored by two Fellows. Admission shall be by ballot. In the case of candidates not able to obtain two sponsor Fellows, it shall be open to the Council after consideration of the circumstances and credentials of the candidate concerned, to waive the necessity for two sponsors from among the Fellowship.
- 4. Council shall cause the names of the Candidates and their Sponsors to be circulated to all Fellows at least 10 days before the date of the meeting at which a ballot is to be held. Fellows may vote against any candidate by striking out the name from the list and returning the list to the Society before the meeting or placing the list in the Ballot Box before the meeting commences. Candidates receiving 10 or more adverse votes will be balloted for individually at the meeting, and any candidate then receiving less than two-thirds of the votes shall not be admitted.
- 5. Honorary Fellows shall consist of persons eminent in any branch of antiquarian study, who must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows; they shall not be liable for any fee for admission or annual subscription. The number of Honorary Fellows shall not exceed 25.
- 6. Corresponding Members must be recommended by the Council and elected in the same way as Fellows. They shall not be liable for a fee for admission or annual subscription. This Law is now repealed.
- Before the name of a newly elected candidate is added to the list of Fellows, he or she shall pay to the funds of the Society an entrance fee and the current year's subscription as provided for by Law 8.
- 8. Rates of entrance fee and annual subscription shall be determined by the Council as required from time to time subject to the approval of the Society given at a General Meeting. The annual subscription shall become due on 1 July in each year for that year then beginning; and if any Fellow who has not compounded shall fail to pay the subscription for one year, due application having been made for payment, the Treasurer shall report the same to Council, by whose authority the name of the defaulter may be erased from the List of Fellows. Fellows whose membership has lapsed, and who wish to rejoin the Society, may do so either (1) by payment of all arrears of subscription in which case they shall receive the relative volumes of the Proceedings, if still available or (2) on payment of the subscription for the current year and of the entrance fee.
- 9. Every Fellow not being in arrears of the annual subscription shall be entitled to receive the printed Proceedings of the Society from the date of election.

- 10. None but Fellows shall vote or hold any office in the Society.
- 11. Subject to the Laws and to the control of the Society in General Meetings, the affairs of the Society shall be managed by a Council elected and appointed as hereinafter set forth. Five members of the Council shall constitute a quorum, provided that number includes one Office-bearer and one elected member of Council.
- 12. The Office-bearers shall consist of a President, three Vice-Presidents and a Treasurer. The President and the Vice-Presidents shall be elected for a period of three years. One of the Vice-Presidents shall retire annually by rotation, and shall not be eligible for re-election to the same office until one year has elapsed. The Treasurer shall be elected for one year and shall be eligible for re-election. The elections shall be by ballot at the Annual General Meetings upon a list issued by the Council for that purpose to the Fellows at least 14 days before the meeting.
- 13. The Council shall consist of the Office-bearers, 12 Fellows elected by the Society, the Chairman of the North East Section, the Conveners of the various Committees appointed by Council as provided for in Law 15, if not already elected members, and the Society representative of the National Museums Scotland (NMS) who is already a Fellow of the Society (nominated by the NMS Board of Trustees).
- 14. Four of the 12 elected members of Council shall retire annually by rotation, and shall not be eligible for re-election as ordinary members of Council until one year has elapsed. Vacancies among the elected members of Council and Office-bearers occurring by completion of term of office, by retirement on rotation, by resignation, death or otherwise, shall be filled by election at the Annual General Meeting, or, in the case of the Treasurer, at any earlier meeting of the Society as decided by the Council. The election shall be by ballot, as provided for by Law 12.
- 15. The Council may appoint committees or individuals to advise on or to take charge of particular departments of the Society's business. Individuals who are not Fellows and Fellows who are not members of the Council shall be eligible for these duties.
- 16. The Annual General Meeting of the Society shall take place on St Andrew's Day, 30 November, or on the following day if the 30th be a Sunday. The business of the Annual General Meeting shall be notified to Fellows at least 14 days before the day of the meeting.
- 17. The Council shall have the power to call Extraordinary General Meetings when they see cause. At least 14 days' notice of an Extraordinary General Meeting shall be given to Fellows.
- 18. Meetings of the Society, termed Ordinary Meetings, shall be held on such dates and at such places as may be determined by the Council. A minimum of six meetings, in addition to the Annual General Meeting provided for in Law 16, shall be held in each year.
- 19. Every proposal for altering the Laws must be made through the Council, which shall cause intimation thereof to be made to all the Fellows at least 30 days before the General Meeting at which it is to be determined on.